Abstracts
Abstracts

Articles

Harsh Justice for International Crimes? Margaret M. deGuzman

As the International Criminal Court (ICC) begins to sentence defendants for war crimes, crimes against humanity, and genocide, it must determine how much punishment is appropriate for these crimes. The initial sentencing decisions are especially important because they will serve as reference points for future sentences at the ICC and will likely influence the sentences of other international courts. Few international norms exist to guide the ICC. The punishment practices of other international courts have been inconsistent, ranging from very mild to quite severe. National norms are even more divergent. Punishments considered appropriate in some systems are deemed inhumane in others. Nonetheless, the limited commentary on the appropriate punishment severity for international crimes largely speaks with one voice: international justice should be harsh.

This Article takes issue with the call for harsh international punishment. Despite distracting appeals to punishment theory, such calls ultimately rest on the intuition that international crimes are so serious as to require harsh punishment. That intuition is misleading because at least in some cases, the rhetoric and narratives surrounding international crimes inflate perceptions of their seriousness. While judges exercising discretion cannot completely avoid the influence of intuitions, they should be cautious in applying them and should seek to develop norms to guide their sentencing decisions. Such norms should be rooted in the human rights regime in which international criminal courts are embedded. Attention to human rights norms will generally counsel leniency, and not harshness.

Comprehensive Immigration Reform(s): Stella Burch Elias

Immigration Regulation Beyond Our Borders

American lawmakers, jurists, and scholars are vigorously debating the future direction of immigration regulation in the United States. Following the passage on July 27, 2013 of Senate Bill 744, some kind of comprehensive reform seems increasingly likely. Immigration law is inherently interjurisdictional and transnational, but thus far the conversation about immigration reform has failed to look beyond our own national borders for alternative models or practices. This Article seeks to broaden the immigration regulation debate by contrasting recent developments in immigration
regulation in the United States with those in other countries with federal systems. In three federal nations that traditionally had widely divergent approaches to immigration regulation—Germany, Australia, and Canada—strikingly similar multitiered, multigovernmental systems of immigration regulation have emerged in recent years. This Article proposes that the future direction of immigration regulation in the United States should consider the German, Australian, and Canadian models of immigration law and policy to shed light on a range of potentially desirable legislative, regulatory, and policy options. The German, Australian, and Canadian experiences strongly suggest that any reform of our own immigration laws should permit states and localities to play a greater role in immigrant selection, a continued role in immigrant inclusion, and a more limited role in the enforcement of immigration laws that exclude immigrants from the country.

Charitable Giving, Tax Expenditures, and Direct Spending in the United States and the European Union

This Article compares the ways in which the United States and the European Union limit the ability of state-level entities to subsidize their own residents, whether through direct subsidies or through tax expenditures. It uses four recent charitable giving cases decided by the European Court of Justice (ECJ) to illustrate the ECJ’s evolving tax expenditure jurisprudence and argues that, while this jurisprudence may suggest a new and promising model for fiscal federalism, it may also have negative social policy implications. It also points out that the court analyzes direct spending and tax expenditures under different rubrics despite their economic equivalence and does not provide a clear rule for distinguishing between the two, adding to the confusion of Member States and taxpayers. The Article then surveys the U.S. Supreme Court’s Dormant Commerce Clause jurisprudence, under which the Court analyzes discriminatory state spending provisions. The Article concludes that although both the Supreme Court and the ECJ prioritize formalism over economic equivalence, the Supreme Court’s approach to tax expenditures is more defensible than that of the ECJ due to the different federal structures of the two jurisdictions.
An Empirical Analysis of CFIUS: Examining Foreign Investment Regulation in the United States

Paul Connell & Tian Huang

With increasing injections of foreign capital in the United States and rising national security concerns, the legislative and executive branches have played an expanded role in policing international investment in American companies. Arguably, no government group serves a more critical gatekeeping role than the Committee on Foreign Investment in the United States (CFIUS). Yet, its evaluative process, which permits it to examine and block any foreign attempt to garner control of an American entity, is completely obscured from the public purview. However, the Committee’s secrecy does not preclude all studies of its review process. Using various government databases and reports, this Note produces one of the first empirical analyses of the CFIUS process. This Note shows through event studies that CFIUS actions lead to large protectionist wealth transfers, and the regression analysis indicates that despite claims of discriminatory application against certain nations, CFIUS denials are best explained by factors relating to valid concerns about national security.
Yale Law School

Officers of Administration
Peter Salovey, A.B., M.A., Ph.D., President of the University
Benjamin Polak, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Provost of the University
Robert C. Post, J.D., Ph.D., Dean
Alvin Keith Klevorick, M.A., Ph.D., Deputy Dean
Michael J. Webster, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Educational Education
S. Blair Kauffman, J.D., L.L.M., LL.M., Law Librarian
Mega A. Barnett, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean
Joseph M. Crosby, B.A., M.B.A., Associate Dean
Toni Hahn Davis, J.D., L.L.M., Associate Dean
Mary Bruce Matheson, B.S., Associate Dean
Kathleen B. Overy, J.D., Ed.D., Associate Dean
Asha Rangappa, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean
Mike K. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Faculty Emeriti
Guido Calabresi, LL.B., Dr. jur., LL.D., D.Phil., H.Litt., D.Politi.Sci., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Devin E. Curis, B.S., L.L.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harlan Leigh Dalas, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Michael Radovis Dunia, J.L., B.A., J.D., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Asch S. Dey, III, B.A., L.L.B., Alfrned M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Stephen H. Deutsch, L.L.B., Ph.D., Walton Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Owen M. Fish, M.A., L.L.B., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert W. Gordon, A.B., J.D., Chancellor Kent Professor Emeritus of Law and Legal History
Michael J. Graj, B.B.A., L.L.B., J.D., Janus S. Hatchet Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Geoffrey Correll Hasad, M.A., L.L.B., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law
Quinlin Johnston, B.A., J.S.D., Joshua S.霍奇斯教授 Emeritus of Law
Daniel L. Luch, M.S.W., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Carol M. Rose, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Peter H. Schuck, M.A., L.L.M., Simon B. Baldwin Professor Emeritus and Professor (Adjunct) of Law
Gail G. Simon, L.L.B., L.L.D., Augustus E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law
Stephen Wainer, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Faculty
Bruce Ackerman, B.A., L.L.B., Sterling Professor of Law and Political Science
Muneer I. Ahmad, A.B., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
Anita L. Allott, B.A., J.D., Jacob D. Birman Professor in Taxation
Allred Reid Artin, B.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law
Jan Areo, J.D., Ph.D., William K. Townsend Professor of Law
Jack M. Balkin, J.D., Ph.D., Knight Professor of Constitutional Law and the First Amendment
Abarra Bank, L.L.M., Dr. Jur., Visiting Professor of Law and Gruber Global Constitutional Fellow (fall term)
Megan A. Barnett, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean
Seyda Beneath, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
Lea Brilmayer, B.A., J.D., Howard M. Hollinsworth Professor of International Law
Richard R. Brooks, Ph.D., J.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law
Robert Amsterdam, B.A., J.D., Alexander M. Ritchel Professor of Law (full term)
Guido Calabresi, LL.B., Dr. jur., LL.D., D.Phil., H.Litt., D.Politi.Sci., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Steven G. Calabresi, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Stephan Little Carver, B.A., J.D., William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law
Amy Chua, A.B., B.A., J.D., John M. Fidji Jr. Professor of Law
Kristin A. Collis, M.A., J.D., Sidney Aschen-Robert D. McLean '70 Visiting Professor of Law
Kristin A. Corby, B.A., M.B.A., B.A., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harlan Leigh Dalas, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Michael Radovis Dunia, J.L., B.A., J.D., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Stephen Downing, Ph.D., B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
Toni Hahn Davis, J.D., L.L.M., Associate Dean
Asch S. Dey, III, B.A., L.L.B., Alfrned M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Giacomo della Canna, Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Jan Gister Deutsch, L.L.B., Ph.D., Walton Flade Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Aaron Dhir, L.L.B., L.L.M., Canadian Binational Visiting Professor of Law
Fiou M. Doherty, B.A., J.D., Clinical Associate Professor of Law
Steven Barry Duker, J.D., L.L.M., Professor of Law
Robert C. Effickson, A.B., L.L.B., Walter E. Meyer Professor of Property and Urban Law (spring term)
Edwin Donald Elliott, B.A., J.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law
William N. Evridge, J.A., J.D., John A. Garver Professor of Jurisprudence
Daniel C. Esty, M.A., J.D., Hillhouse Professor of Environmental Law and Policy, School of Forestry & Environmental Studies; and Clinical Professor of Environmental Law and Policy, Law School
Owen M. Fox, M.A., L.L.B., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
James Forman, Jr., A.B., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
Emmanuel Galli{114}, Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)
Leah Garlick, Doctorate in Legal Sciences, National Legal Sciences, Visiting Professor of Law and Peter and Patricia Gruber Fellow in Global Justice (fall term)
Heather K. Gordon, B.A., J.D., Skelly Wright Professor of Law
Paul Grewitz, B.A., J.D., Potter Stewart Professor of Constitutional Law
Albrecht Grahl, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law
Robert W. Gordon, A.B., J.D., Chancellor Kent Professor Emeritus of Law and Legal History
Michelle Gostin, B.B.A., B.A., L.L.B., L.L.D., Justice S. Furhman Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law (fall term)
David Singh Greweal, J.D., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Law
Dover Grim, L.L.M., Dr. Jur., Visiting Professor of Law and Peter and Patricia Gruber Fellow in Global Justice (spring term)
Henry B. Hartmann, Ph.D., Oscar M. Riedel Professor of Law
Dente R. Harrison, J.D., Ph.D., Lecturer in Legal Method
Ora Hallaway, B.A., J.D., Gerard C. and Bernice Larios Smith Professor of International Law
Quinlin Johnston, B.A., J.S.D., Janus S. Hatchet Professor Emeritus of Law
Christine Jolls, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor of Law and Organization
Lee M. Kahen, B.A., J.D., Elizabeth K. Dollard Professor of Law and Professor of Psychology
Paul W. Kahn, J.D., Ph.D., Robert W. Winner Professor of Law and the Humanities
Amy Kacynski, M.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law
S. Blair Kauffman, J.D., L.L.M., LL.M., Law Librarian and Professor of Law
George Knaup, B.A., J.D., Florence Robog Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Dudley Keatts, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
Alvin Keith Klevorick, M.A., Ph.D., Deputy Dean, John Thomas Smith Professor of Law, and Professor of Economics
Jonathan Klick, Ph.D., J.D., Maurice & Greenberg Visiting Professor of Law (full term)
Harold Noriga Koh, A.B., J.D., Sterling Professor of International Law
Lecturers in Law

Mike K. Alm Stone Swet, M.A., Associate Dean

Emily Barlow, B.A., J.D.

Greg Gonsalves, B.S.

Linda Greenhouse, B.A., M.S.L., Joseph Goldstein Lecturer in Law

Lucas Guttinger, A.B., J.D.

Su Lin Han, M.A., J.D.

Jamie P. Horvitz, M.A., J.D.

Morgan E. Kaminski, B.A., B.S.

Hope R. Meatalf, B.A., J.D.

James E. Petor, M.A., J.D.

Yael Shavit, B.A., J.D.

Robert D. Williams, B.A., J.D.

Visiting Lecturers in Law

Guillermo Aguile-Alvarez, Lic. en Derecho (J.D.)

Yas Banfiemns, Ph.D., LL.M.

Richard Hart, M.A., J.D., John R. Ruben/Sullivan & Cromwell Visiting Lecturer in Accounting

Stephen B. Bright, B.A., J.D., Harvey Kaplan Visiting Lecturer in Law

Lincoln Caplin, A.B., J.D.

Susan L. Carney, B.A., J.D.

Robert N. Charing, B.A., J.D.

Tatiana C. Collins, B.A., M.B.A.

Victoria A. Candia, B.A., J.D.

Brian T. Daly, M.A., J.D.

Karl (Tom) Denneschman, B.A., J.D.

Eugene R. Fiddel, B.A., M.A., Florenceрожев Visiting Lecturer in Law

Gregory Fleming, B.A., J.D.

Lawrence J. Fox, B.A., J.D., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law

Stephen Fradlin, B.A., B.B.

Peter T. Grossi, Jr., M.A., J.D.

Benjamin W. Heasman, Jr., B.S., LL.B., J.D.

Frank Incorco, B.A., B.A., LL.M., Grober Global Constitutional Fellow

Andrew J. Finer, B.A., B.A.

Megan Quattlebaum, B.A., J.D.

Eric S. Robinson, B.A., J.D.

Charles A. Roshlid, A.B., J.D.

Sarah Ruzell, B.A., B.J.
John M. Samuels, J.D., LL.M.
Paul Schwabe, M.A., Ph.D.
Michael S. Solender, B.A., J.D.
Sidney H. Stein, A.B., J.D.
Stefan R. Underhill, B.A., J.D.
John M. Walker, Jr., B.A., J.D.
Ashbel T. Wall II, B.A., J.D.

† On leave of absence, fall term, 2013-2014.
‡ On leave of absence, spring term, 2014.
THE YALE JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 39, Number 1, Winter 2014

Editors-in-Chief
DEBORAH I. FRANCOIS
GRACE KIM

Executive Editors
SHOUVIK BHATTACHARYA
BENJAMIN F. FARKAS
ALISA SHEKHTMAN
WILL SMILEY

Managing Editors
ABIGAIL GRABER
SHENG LI
CANEL TROUILLOT

Features Editors
MATTHEW BLUMENTHAL
ALEXANDER M. DIERASSI
BEN GRAHAM
WILLIAM KALEMA
ALLANA KEMBAZI
DAVID RANCE
JENNIFER SKENE
BRIANNA VAN KAN

Articles Editors
CHARLES DAMERON
ALLISON DAY
JORDAN C. HIRSCH
SAMUEL KLEINER
Tiffany NG
ROBERT NIGHTINGALE
TEMIDAYO OBUSOLU
REEMA SHAH

Development Editor
BRIANNA VAN KAN

Production Editor
BEN GRAHAM

Senior Editors
KYLE DELBRYCK
RACHEL DEMPSEY
CARLTON FORBES
FARSHAD GHODODSI
ADAM GOLDENBERG
CHRISTINA KONGISOR

Editors
LYNSEY GAUDROS†
MARGARET GOGLANDER
JONATHAN GREENSTEIN
DANIEL HESSEL
GRACE HEUSNER
YUE HUANG
JAYOUNG JEON
TANYA KAPOOR
ALEXANDER KAZAM
ROBERT KLEPPER
JULIA KNIGHT
STEVEN LEVY
JEREMY LISS
CARMEN LU
AMANDA LYNCH
MATTHEW MELLEMA
MAEGHAN MIKORSKI
HAVA MIRELL†

† Source Coordinator

Submissions Editors
MARVIN BROWN
JOHN CALHOUN
LESLEY ESBRICK
PHILIPP KOTYLABA
BRIAN SWEENEY
LILIAN TIMMERMANN
JOHN C. WEI
MENG JIA YANG
The editors would like to acknowledge, with gratitude, the generous support for the *Yale Journal of International Law* in its thirty-ninth year from:

**CHARLES L. FELSENTHAL**
**CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP**
**Debevoise & Plimpton LLP**
**THE FELSENTHAL DONATION IN MEMORY OF HARRY D. FELSENTHAL**
**FRESHFIELDS BRUCKHAUS DERINGER LLP**
**W. MICHAEL REISMAN**
**NICHOLAS ROSTOW**
**THE ROSTOW DONATION IN MEMORY OF EUGENE V. ROSTOW**
**SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP**

The editors would also like to recognize the thoughtful contributions of:

**OONA A. HATHAWAY**
**HAROLD HONGJU KOH**
**ROBERT C. POST**
**KEVIN ROSE**
**SUSAN ROSE-ACKERMAN**
**SCOTT SHAPIRO**
**MIKE K. THOMPSON**
**THE YJIL ADVISORY BOARD**