2015

Contents

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/yjil

Part of the Law Commons

Recommended Citation

Available at: http://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/yjil/vol40/iss1/1

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by Yale Law School Legal Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Yale Journal of International Law by an authorized administrator of Yale Law School Legal Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact julian.aiken@yale.edu.
Contents

Articles
Reforming the State from Afar: Structural Reform Litigation at the Human Rights Courts  
Alexandra Huneeus 1

“Reasonable Doubt” in Islamic Law  
Intisar A. Rabb 41

Rethinking the Temporary Breach Puzzle: A Window on the Future of International Trade Conflicts  
Mark Wu 95

Note
Is Successful Water Privatization a Pipe Dream?: An Analysis of Three Global Case Studies  
Tanya Kapoor 157

Recent Developments
Recent Publications
The editors would like to acknowledge, with gratitude, the generous support for the *Yale Journal of International Law* in its fortieth year from:

**CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP**  
**Debevoise & Plimpton LLP**  
**Charles L. Felsenthal**  
**The Felsenthal Donation in Memory of Harry D. Felsenthal**  
**Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer LLP**  
**W. Michael Reisman**  
**Nicholas Rostow**  
**The Rostow Donation in Memory of Eugene V. Rostow**  
**Sullivan & Cromwell LLP**

The editors would also like to recognize the thoughtful contributions of:

**Harold Hongju Koh**  
**Robert C. Post**  
**W. Michael Reisman**  
**Kevin Rose**  
**Susan Rose-Ackerman**  
**Scott Shapiro**  
**Mike K. Thompson**  
**The YJIL Advisory Board**
Abstracts

Articles

Reforming the State from Afar: Structural Reform Litigation at the Human Rights Courts
Alexandra Huneeus 1

The most recent twist in the story of structural reform litigation is international. To their traditional role of declaring violations and ordering remedies for victims, the European and the Inter-American Courts of Human Rights have added a more ambitious project: the implementation of structural changes at the national level. And, like the U.S. Supreme Court in the school desegregation and prison reform cases, they have begun to encounter their own institutional and political limits. This Article is the first to view the courts' recent forays into structural reform litigation through a comparative lens. Using Abram Chayes' classic study of public law litigation in the United States as a springboard, it reveals the reasons for the emergence of structural reform litigation at the transnational level, and the unique strategies the courts use to maintain legitimacy despite stretching their mandates.

"Reasonable Doubt" in Islamic Law
Intisar A. Rabb 41

Against a popular notion of Islamic law as a limited set of texts of divine origin that bar judicial discretion and require harsh punishment, this Article argues that Muslim jurists historically generated a doctrine of "reasonable doubt" in response to changing social and political contexts. In a move astonishing for its boldness and its virtual invisibility, those jurists transformed the doubt doctrine from reports of early judicial practices into a foundational legal text. That is, jurists writing at the end of the long founding period of Islamic law (seventh to eleventh centuries) successfully claimed that the Prophet Muhammad himself had announced a "doubt canon" in the seventh century—directing judges to avoid criminal punishments in cases of doubt. The transformation was so complete and the claim so effective that few later jurists were aware of the dubious prophetic pedigree for the Islamic doctrine of doubt. Remarkably, medieval Muslim jurists deployed concepts of doubt to assert interpretive power over Islamic law, to define institutional relationships, and either to curb executive overreach or to assert parameters for legitimate punishment. In effect, they used ever-expanding definitions of doubt to construct the very elements and institutions of legitimate crime and punishment that they sought to regulate.
This surprising turn of events is like a modern-day U.S. constitutional amendment that passes without going through any legislation or ratification process, and where history forgets that the textual modification was not a part of the original document. The forgotten history of doubt in Islamic law is crucial to understanding the most pressing questions surrounding the reemergence of Islamic law as state law in modern constitutional and criminal contexts. As an originalist legal tradition, Islamic law today heavily relies on the past for definitions of Islamic constitutional and criminal law, often in ways that are unaware of the prominent role of discretion and doubt in Islam's founding period and beyond. This Article explores the history of doubt.

Rethinking the Temporary Breach Puzzle: A Window on the Future of International Trade Conflicts

Mark Wu  95

The World Trade Organization (WTO) is held out as an exemplar of an effectively functioning international "court." Yet, a puzzle remains unexplained: in WTO litigation, a respondent found to have enacted an illegal trade policy measure needs only to remedy the illegality. So long as it does, the WTO lacks the authority to order retrospective remedies to be paid to the complainant for past harm. The remedies loophole provides countries with a "free pass" for temporary breach. Why do more countries not take advantage of this pass more frequently? How is it that the WTO manages to function effectively in spite of its imperfect remedies?

This Article suggests that the key to understanding the answer to this puzzle lies in the importance of power asymmetries in a WTO system that is dynamic and evolving. It identifies a series of policy instruments available to a powerful country whenever its trading partner is tempted to undertake a temporary breach that harms the powerful state's interests. These instruments create additional costs that offset the benefit of any temporary breach, thereby effectively deterring most, albeit not all, temporary breaches. In addition, the established powers share a collective interest in maintaining the WTO system's stability. This also causes them to exercise collective self-restraint in their own exercise of temporary breaches.

The answer to this puzzle is of more than just academic importance. It also sheds important light on the future of the international trade regime. As geopolitical power shifts and trade among developing countries increases, particular countries may find it more tempting to engage in temporary breaches under certain circumstances. This Article examines the nature of these emergent conflicts and discusses its implications for the future of the global trading regime.
For decades, governments across the world have struggled to privatize their water systems. In the developing world, water privatizations have often led to bitter populist clashes, public health crises, and cancelled concession agreements. This Note studies three water privatizations and analyzes why certain privatizations fail and others succeed. By analyzing privatizations through three factors—class dynamics, deal structure, and political climate—this Note suggests ways in which developing governments can structure water privatizations to deliver long-term improvements to local communities. This Note argues that successful water privatizations often dilute class dynamics by instituting progressive pricing schemes, promote business transparency by requiring stringent due diligence, and advance citizens' interests by employing strict regulatory oversight. By replicating these features, developing governments are more likely to negotiate successful water privatization deals on behalf of their citizens.
YALE LAW SCHOOL

Officers of Administration
Peter Salovey, A.B., A.M., Ph.D., President of the University
Benjamin Polak, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Provost of the University
Robert C. Post, J.D., Ph.D., Dean
Alvin K. Klevorick, M.A., Ph.D., Deputy Dean
Michael J. Wishnie, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean for Experiential Education
S. Blair Kauftman, J.D., LL.M., M.L.L., Law Librarian
Megan A. Barnett, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean
Joseph M. Crosby, B.A., M.B.A., Associate Dean
Toni Hahn Davis, J.D., LL.M., Associate Dean
Mary Briese Matheron, B.S., Associate Dean
Kathleen B. Overly, J.D., Ed.D., Associate Dean
Asha Rangappa, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean
Mike K. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Faculty Emeriti
Guido Calabresi, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Dennis E. Curtis, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harlon L. Dalton, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Mirjan R. Damalka, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Drew S. Days, Ill, B.A., LL.B., Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Jan Ginter Deutsch, LL.B., Ph.D., Walton Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Owen M. Fiss, M.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert W. Gordon, A.B., J.D., Chancellor Kent Professor Emeritus of Law and Legal History
Michael J. Graetz, B.B.A., LL.B., LL.D., Justus S. Hotchkiss Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Carroll L. Lucht, M.S.W., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Carol M. Rose, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Peter H. Schuck, M.A., J.D., LL.M., Simeon E. Baldwin Professor Emeritus and Professor (Adjunct) of Law
John G. Simon, LL.B., LL.D., Augustus Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law
Stephen Wizner, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglass Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Faculty
Bruce Ackerman, B.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law and Political Science
Muneer I. Ahmad, A.B., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
Anne L. Alstott, B.A., J.D., Jacob N. Bierman Professor in Taxation
Akhil Reed Amar, B.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law
Ian Ayres, J.D., Ph.D., William K. Townsend Professor of Law
Jack M. Balkin, J.D., Ph.D., Knight Professor of Constitutional Law and the First Amendment
Aharon Barak, LL.M., Dr.Jur., Visiting Professor of Law and Gruber Global Constitutionalism Fellow (fall term)
Seyla Benhabib, Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)
Eyal Benvenisti, J.S.D., LL.M., LL.B., Visiting Professor of Law and Patricia Gruber Fellow in Global Justice (spring term)
Philip C. Bobbitt, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Florence Ruggles Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Lea Brilmayer, J.D., LL.M., Howard M. Holtzmann Professor of International Law
Richard W. Brooks, Ph.D., J.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law
† Robert A. Burt, M.A., J.D., Alexander M. Bickel Professor of Law (fall term)
† Guido Calabresi, LL.B., Dr.Jur., LL.D., Ph.D., H.Lit.D., D.Pol.Sci., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Steven G. Calabresi, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Stephen L. Carter, B.A., J.D., William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law
Amy Chua, A.B., J.D., John M. Duff, Jr. Professor of Law
Dennis E. Curtis, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harlon L. Dalton, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Mirjan R. Damalka, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Drew S. Days, Ill, B.A., LL.B., Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Jan Ginter Deutsch, LL.B., Ph.D., Walton Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Aaron Dhir, LL.B., LL.M., Canadian Bicentennial Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Fiona Doherty, B.A., J.D., Clinical Associate Professor of Law
Steven B. Duke, J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law
Zev J. Eisen, B.S., J.D., Ph.D., Irving S. Rubicoff Visiting Associate Professor of Law (spring term)
† Robert C. Ellickson, A.B., LL.B., Walter E. Meyer Professor of Property and Urban Law
E. Donald Elliott, B.A., J.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law
William N. Eskridge, Jr., M.A., J.D., John A. Garver Professor of Jurisprudence
Daniel C. Esty, M.A., J.D., Hillhouse Professor of Environmental Law and Policy, School of Forestry & Environmental Studies; and Clinical Professor of Environmental Law and Policy, Law School
Owen M. Fiss, M.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
James Forman, Jr., A.B., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
Emmanuel Gaillard, Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)
Heather K. Gerken, B.A., J.D., J. Skelly Wright Professor of Law
Paul Gewirtz, B.A., J.D., Potter Stewart Professor of Constitutional Law
Abbe R. Gluck, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law
Robert W. Gordon, A.B., J.D., Chancellor Kent Professor Emeritus of Law and Legal History (full term)
Gary B. Gorton, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (full term)
Michael J. Greetz, B.B.A., LL.B., LL.D., Justus S. Hotchkins Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law (full term)
David Singh Grewal, J.D., Ph.D., Florence Rogatz Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Moshe Halbertal, B.A., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Law
Henry B. Hansmann, A.B., J.D., Oscar M. Ruebhausen Professor of Law
Robert D. Harrison, J.D., Ph.D., Lecturer in Legal Method
Oona Hathaway, B.A., J.D., Gerard C. and Bernice Latrobe Smith Professor of International Law and Organization
Edward J. Janger, B.A., J.D., Maurice R. Greenberg Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)
Christine Ji, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor of Law and Organization
Dan M. Kahn, B.A., J.D., Elizabeth K. Dollard Professor of Law and Professor of Psychology
Paul W. Kahn, J.D., Ph.D., Robert W. Winner Professor of Law and the Humanities
Johanna Kalb, B.A., M.A., J.D., Visiting Associate Professor of Law
Amy Kapczynski, M.A., Ph.D., Deputy Dean, John Thomas Smith Professor of Law, and Professor of Economics
Harold Hongiu Koh, A.B., J.D., Sterling Professor of International Law
Issa Kohler-Hausmann, J.D., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Law and Associate Professor of Sociology
Anthony T. Kronman, J.D., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law
Mattias Kymmen, LL.M., J.S.D., Florence Rogatz Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Douglas Kysar, B.A., J.D., Joseph M. Field ’53 Professor of Law
Christian Landfried, M.A., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)
John H. Langbein, LL.B., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law and Legal History
Anika Singh Leman, B.A., J.D., Clinical Associate Professor of Law
Maeve H. Lemos, B.A., J.D., Anne Uroway Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Sanford V. Levinson, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (full term)
Yair Listokin, Ph.D., J.D., Shirley Family Fund Professor of Law
Carroll L. Lucey, M.S.W., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Jonathan R. Macey, A.B., J.D., Sam Harris Professor of Corporate Law, Corporate Finance, and Securities Law
Daniel Markovits, D.Phil., J.D., Guido Calabresi Professor of Law
Jerry L. Mashaw, LL.B., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law
Tracey L. Meares, B.S., J.D., Walton Hale Hamilton Professor of Law
Noah Messing, B.A., Ph.D., Lecturer in the Practice of Law and Legal Writing
Alice Miller, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
John D. Morley, B.S., B.S., J.D., Associate Professor of Law
Angela Onwuachi-Willig, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (full term)
Nicholas R. Parrillo, M.A., J.D., Professor of Law
Jean Koh Peters, A.B., J.D., Sol Goldman Clinical Professor of Law and Supervising Attorney
Robert C. Post, Ph.D., Dean and Sol & Lillian Goldman Professor of Law
J. L. Pottenger, Jr., A.B., J.D., Nathan Baker Clinical Professor of Law and Supervising Attorney
Claire Priest, J.D., Ph.D., Simeon E. Baldwin Professor of Law
George L. Priest, B.A., J.D., Edward J. Phelps Professor of Law and Economics and Kaufman Distinguished Research Scholar in Law, Economics, and Entrepreneurship
W. Michael Reisman, B.A., J.S.D., Myra S. McDougall Professor of International Law
Judith Resnik, B.A., J.D., Arthur Liman Professor of Law
Simeon E. Baldwin Professor of Law (spring term)
Roberta Romano, M.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law
Carol M. Rose, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Susan Rose-Ackerman, B.A., Ph.D., Henry R. Luce Professor of Jurisprudence (Law School and Department of Political Science)
Jed Rubenfeld, A.B., J.D., Robert R. Slaughter Professor of Law
Charles F. Sabel, A.B., Ph.D., Florence Rogatz Visiting Professor of Law
Albie Sachs, Law, Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Gruber Global Constitutionalism Fellow (fall term)
Wojciech Sadurski, LL.M., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)
Peter H. Schuck, M.A., J.D., LL.M., Simeon E. Baldwin Professor Emeritus and Professor (Adjunct) of Law (full term)
Jason M. Schultz, B.A., J.D., Florence Rogatz Visiting Clinical Associate Professor of Law (spring term)
Vicki Schultz, B.A., J.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Law and Social Sciences
Alan Schwartz, M.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law
Scott J. Shapiro, J.D., Ph.D., Charles F. Sabel Professor of Law and Professor of Philosophy
Robert J. Shiller, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (full term)
Reva Siegel, M.Phil., J.D., Nicholas deB. Katzenbach Professor of Law
Norman I. Silber, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
† James J. Silk, M.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
John G. Simon, LL.B., LL.D., Augustus E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law
Kate Stith, M.P.P., J.D., Lafayette S. Foster Professor of Law
† Alec Stone Sweet, M.A., Ph.D., Leitner Professor of International Law, Politics, and International Studies
Heather E. Tookes, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)
Gerald Torres, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)
† Tom R. Tyler, M.A., Ph.D., Macklin Fleming Professor of Law and Professor of Psychology
Neil Walker, LL.B., Ph.D., LL.D., Sidney Austin-Robert D. McLean Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Patrick Well, M.B.A., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Oscar M. Ruebhausen Distinguished Fellow in Law (fall term)
† James Q. Whitman, J.D., Ph.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Comparative and Foreign Law
Ralph K. Winter, Jr., M.A.H., LL.B., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
Michael J. Waksie, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean for Experiential Education, William O. Douglas Clinical Professor of Law, and Director, Jerome N. Frank Legal Services Organization
John Fabian Witt, J.D., Ph.D., Allen H. Duff Class of 1960 Professor of Law
Stephen Wizner, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Gideon Yaffe, A.B., Ph.D., Professor of Law, Professor of Philosophy, and Professor of Psychology
Howard V. Zonana, B.A., M.D., Professor of Psychiatry and Clinical Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Lecturers in Law
Emily Bazelon, B.A., J.D.
James Dawson, B.A., J.D.
Gregg Gonsalves, B.S.
Linda Greenhouse, B.A., M.S.L., Joseph Goldstein Lecturer in Law
John Allen Grim, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.
Lucas Guttentag, A.B., J.D.
Mary Evelyn Tucker, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.

Visiting Lecturers in Law
Guillermo Aguilar-Alvarez, Lic. en Derecho (J.D.)
Yas Banifatemi, Ph.D., LL.M.
Mark Barnes, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
Richard Baxter, M.A., J.D., John R. Raben/Sullivan & Cromwell Visiting Lecturer in Accounting
Stephen B. Bright, B.A., J.D., Harvey Karp Visiting Lecturer in Law
Lincoln Caplan, A.B., J.D., Truman Capote Visiting Lecturer in Law
Robert N. Chatigny, A.B., J.D.
Wayne Dale Collins, B.S., M.S., J.D.
Victoria A. Cundiff, B.A., J.D.
Melanie L. Fein, B.A., J.D.
Eugene R. Fidell, B.A., LL.B., Florence Rogatz Visiting Lecturer in Law
Gregory Fleming, B.A., J.D.
Lawrence J. Fox, B.A., J.D., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law
Stephen Fraidin, A.B., LL.B.
Peter T. Groszi, Jr., M.A., J.D.
Katherine M. Kimpel, B.A., J.D.
Jeffrey A. Meyer, B.A., J.D.
Charles M. Nathan, B.A., J.D.
Eric S. Robinson, M.B.A., J.D.
Sarah French Russell, B.A., J.D.
John M. Samuels, J.D., LL.M., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law
Michael S. Solender, B.A., J.D.
David J. Stoll, B.A., J.D.
Jake Sullivan, B.A., M.Phil, J.D., Oscar M. Ruebhausen Distinguished Visiting Lecturer in National Security
Stefan R. Underhill, B.A., J.D.
John M. Walker, Jr., B.A., J.D., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law
David M. Zornow, B.A., J.D.

‡ On leave of absence, spring term, 2015.
The Yale Journal of International Law
Volume 40, Number 1, Winter 2015

Advisory Board

Robert B. Ahdieh
Professor, Emory Law School

Oona A. Hathaway
Professor, Yale Law School

Nicholas Rostow
Professor, National Defense University, Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 7

Lea Brilmayer
Professor, Yale Law School

Melanie Khanna
Senior Donor Relations Officer, United Nations Human Rights Council

Stephen Ruckman
Special Appointee, Executive Division, Maryland Attorney General’s Office, Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 32

Amy Chua
Professor, Yale Law School

Mitchel Lasser
Professor, Cornell University Law School

James J. Silk
Professor, Yale Law School

Mirjan Damask
Professor, Yale Law School

Janet Koven Levit
Dean, University of Tulsa College of Law

Alec Stone Sweet
Professor, Yale Law School

Laura Dickinson
Professor, The George Washington University Law School

Greta S. Milligan
Assistant General Counsel to the US Trade Representative, Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 33

Patricia Wald
Judge, D.C. Circuit Court of Appeals (Retired)

Owen M. Fiss
Professor, Yale Law School

Robert C. Post
Dean, Yale Law School

John D. Watson, Jr.
Partner, Latham & Watkins LLP, Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 9

Paul Gewirtz
Professor, Yale Law School

W. Michael Reisman
Professor, Yale Law School

James Q. Whitman
Professor, Yale Law School

Susan Rose-Ackerman
Professor, Yale Law School