1-1-1936

Cases on the Law of Bankruptcy

Myres S. McDougal
Yale Law School

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/fss_papers

Part of the Law Commons

Recommended Citation
http://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/fss_papers/2458

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Yale Law School Faculty Scholarship at Yale Law School Legal Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Scholarship Series by an authorized administrator of Yale Law School Legal Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact julian.aiken@yale.edu.
called attention to the requirements for improvement in administration, perhaps study of probate records can follow in order to supply data and argument for the effort to bring about change. At best, legislative inertia will be difficult to overcome in a matter which can hardly be raised to a prominent place in the public consciousness. If the monograph, despite its faults, can contribute to at least a professional appreciation of guardianship as an aspect of welfare administration rather than as a branch of private law, it will serve a useful purpose.

RALPH F. FUCHS

St. Louis, Mo.


In his revision of Holbrook and Aigler Professor Billig announces the modest purpose of presenting teaching materials on the recent developments in bankruptcy law "against the background of a standard casebook . . . well known to law teachers." This precludes him from altering the structure of the book but not from effecting a thorough redecoration. The chapter and section headings of the earlier edition have been retained in their original sequence and a few new sections and one new chapter have been added. The six chapter headings in order of appearance are: Jurisdiction, Prerequisites to Adjudication, Administration, Compositions, Discharge, and The Amendments of 1933, 1934, 1935. The high abstraction to which this organization drives the editors is well illustrated in Chapter II (Prerequisites to Adjudication), Section II (Involuntary Proceedings), Subsection D (Acts of Bankruptcy), Arabic numeral 1 (Conveyances with Intent to Hinder, Delay, or Defraud). The materials reprinted here are subdivided by the present editor into three parts: (a) Independent of Bankruptcy, (b) As an Act of Bankruptcy, and (c) Voidable by the Trustee. The first part contains forty pages of none too enlightening text, the second part offers the single case of American Surety Co. v. Marotta (287 U. S. 513) and a footnote, and the third part yields for its first three cases Benedict v. Ratner (268 U. S. 353), Dean v. Davis (242 U. S. 438), and Moore v. Bay (284 U. S. 4). Even the ablest teachers are likely to find difficulty in making anything out of these cases in such a setting. (Professor Billig foresees this objection and suggests that some teachers may wish to postpone consideration of part (c) until a later chapter is reached.) Similar criticism could be made of the long subsection on preferences (Arabic numeral 2 of the same chapter). But to criticize the organization of this edition is to criticize that of the earlier editions, and in the case of a book so well known such an undertaking could be hardly other than superfluous.

In his redecoration of the earlier structure Professor Billig has done a workmanlike job. More than half of the opinions that he reprints at length are from cases decided since the publication date of the last edition. These cases are well selected and the opinions are presented without too much editing. They are supplemented by some text material and by annotation that is luxuriant in its reference to law review sources and other cases. The editor pays tribute to his wife for excellent work in the chapter on Discharge.

†Professor of Law, Washington University.
BOOK REVIEWS

To criticize the apportionment of space in a book so brief is perhaps unjust. But the single case of Cumberland Glass Manufacturing Co. v. De Witt (237 U.S. 447) and a lengthy note seem hardly adequate for "mutual debts and credits." And it is surprising to find an editor who has long been a champion of extra-judicial administration of insolvent estates disposing of assignments for benefit of creditors with a reference back to a case used in another connection and a single footnote. There are, of course, no materials in any part of the book that can be used to build up for students the background in extra-judicial methods of insolvency administration and in equity receiverships that seems almost indispensable to a thorough understanding of bankruptcy problems. The book is clearly designed for schools giving but brief attention to a separate subject of insolvency administration. In such schools it will undoubtedly achieve the same popularity as did its predecessor.

MYRES S. MCDONALD

New Haven, Conn.


This second edition of Professor Hanna's casebook on CREDITORS' RIGHTS is in structure and content much like the first. Its chief contribution is not in its organization or in the way the cases are put together in particular sections, but in the amount, quality, and timeliness of the materials reprinted. The book is again built about two distinct sets of problems: (a) the remedies of individual creditors, and (b) the administration of debtors' estates by creditors' representatives. Yet to the first of these less than one-sixth of the total space of the book is devoted; and the author's major formal division of his materials merely marks off bankruptcy problems from non-bankruptcy problems. Part I, covering 479 pages, includes chapters on Enforcement of Judgments, Fraudulent Conveyances, General Assignments, Creditors' Agreements, and Receivership. Part II, covering 768 pages, presents six chapters on Bankruptcy: Introduction (historical summary, annotated reprint of the 1898 statute and its amendments, scope of bankruptcy jurisdiction, effect of national act upon state laws); Bankruptcy Administration; Acts of Bankruptcy; Assets of the Estate; Claims and Distribution; Extensions, Compositions and Reorganizations. There is little that is suggestive or "functional" in this seriatim presentation of remedies and methods of administration. For quick reference it may be convenient; but its adequacy for classroom instruction that purports to stress comparative study of remedies and methods is questionable. Some teachers will still prefer the more imaginative and intricate plans of Billig and Carey in their CASES ON ADMINISTRATION OF INSOLVENT ESTATES and of Sturges in his CASES ON ADMINISTRATION OF DEBTORS' ESTATES.

In Professor Hanna's first edition the cases were carefully selected and edited, stimulating annotation was abundant, and citation to collateral material was more than sufficient. This high standard is maintained in the new edition and the materials are extended to include the multitudinous problems created by the recent amendments to the Bankruptcy Act. More than seventy of the cases presented in extenso in the new edition date within the last five years; few, if any, of the recent "landmarks" escape some kind of notice. Considerable portions of the text and annotation have

†Associate Professor of Law, Yale University.