

Closing Remarks

Jay Katz: From Adjunct to Core

Guido Calabresi, M.A., LL.B.*

What is left to say after this wonderful Symposium? A lot, actually. Taking the titles of the keynote presentations and extrapolating from them reveals what I mean.

The title of Robert Burt's presentation was "The Uses of Psychoanalysis in the Law: Illuminating Biomedical Ethics."¹ Extrapolate this to: "Illuminating Medical Ethics." Jay has done this magnificently, not only through his knowledge of psychoanalysis, but through his extraordinary life experiences, some of which—like those of being a refugee, an immigrant, and an outsider—I share in part, but many of which are unique to him. Jay has also illuminated medical ethics through his exceptional understanding of law—in *its* fullest meaning, and of medicine, in *its* fullest meaning.

Alex Capron's presentation was entitled "Experimentation with Human Beings: Light or Only Shadows?"² Let us call it: "Human Beings: Light or Only Shadows?" What are we? Are we capable of being both immensely good and appallingly bad? What can we achieve that will survive us? Few can speak to such things intelligibly. Fewer still can do so with any depth. Jay has done so deeply, feelingly, and with both nuance and strength. We have all been enlightened, even when he looked into the shadows.

The third presentation, by Ellyn Wright Clayton, was entitled "The

* Judge, United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit; Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law, Yale Law School. This text is a lightly edited transcript of remarks delivered at a symposium honoring Jay Katz on October 15, 2004. See David Tolley, *Foreword—A World Less Silent: Celebrating Jay Katz's Contributions to Law, Medicine and Ethics*, 6 YALE J. HEALTH POL'Y L. & ETHICS 393 (2006).

1. This presentation is published under a slightly modified title. See Robert A. Burt, *The Uses of Psychoanalysis in the Law: The Force of Jay Katz's Example*, 6 YALE J. HEALTH POL'Y L. & ETHICS 401 (2006).

2. Alex M. Capron, *Experimentation with Human Beings: Light or Only Shadows?*, 6 YALE J. HEALTH POL'Y L. & ETHICS 431 (2006).

Physician-Patient Relationship.”³ Take from this: “Relationship.” And this is my theme. Jay came to the Yale Law School as an adjunct—that is, connected to the law school, but, in a literal sense, also peripheral. He was the same in the medical school—again, connected, but peripheral. I knew him way back then. I knew those who, with the best of intentions (perhaps), meant to keep him peripheral, to keep his “relationship” that of adjunct. And I watched with delight, amazement, affection, and admiration, as this “Master of Relationship” became ever more central, fundamental, and ultimately the absolute core of our enterprise. Was it the result of his soaring scholarship, or was his soaring scholarship the result of his having become truly and completely interdisciplinary—at the center of law and medicine no less than of psychoanalysis? Who can say? Maybe it was both. But his capacity for “relationship,” in the very best sense of that word, was certainly a crucial part of that achievement from which we, and the whole world of scholarship and of humane dealings, have benefited. Who can believe that Jay was ever “adjunct”? For there is no one who—in his relationship with students and colleagues, and with legal and medical scholarship—is more at the heart of what we are about, and whose achievements we are more proud to claim for *our* school.

Let us take another cut at excerpting the words in the all of the titles: “Jay Katz: Illuminating Ethical Human Relationships.” Jay, we are in your debt; we will remain so as long as we walk this earth, and those who follow will continue to benefit from what you have done, long after we all are gone!

Thank you, dear teacher and friend.

3. This presentation is published under a slightly modified title. See Ellyn Wright Clayton, *The Web of Relations: Thinking About Physicians and Patients*, 6 YALE J. HEALTH POL’Y L. & ETHICS 465 (2006).