THE YALE JOURNAL
OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 38, Number 1, Winter 2013

Contents

Articles

On the Constitutionality of Tax Treaties  
Rebecca M. Kysar  1

The Crime and Punishment of States  
Gabriella Blum  57

The Power To Detain: Detention of Terrorism Suspects After 9/11  
Oona Hathaway, Samuel Adelsberg, Spencer Amdur, Philip Levitz, Freya Pitts & Sirine Shebaya  123

Note

When Does Internet Denial Trigger the Right of Armed Self-Defense?  
Sheng Li  179

Comment

Christopher X and CNIL: A Clarion Call To Revitalize the Hague Conventions  
Daniel S. Alterbaum  217

Address

Distant Genocides  
Pierre N. Leval  231

Recent Publications  
253
Taxes kindled the American Revolution. Revolt against collecting revenues without representation caused a tea party, propelling the colonies toward convening the First Continental Congress. Forgotten, though, is the role of taxes in shaping our fledgling nation immediately after the Revolution. Control over which governmental body could impose taxes inflamed the delegates to the Constitutional Convention. So important was the issue that the decision to originate revenue bills in the lower house of Congress constituted a cornerstone of the Great Compromise, thus birthing the representational structure of our country. This principle became embodied in the Constitution as the Origination Clause, ensuring that the power to tax would begin with the house that was directly elected and proportionate to the population.

Tax treaties (generally, bilateral instruments that mitigate or eliminate double taxation of income across jurisdictions) upset this carefully constructed intra-congressional balance. Because tax treaties are self-executing, meaning that they need no implementing legislation to take legal effect, the ratification of a tax treaty cuts the House of Representatives out of the process of legislating in the area of international taxation. This outcome, I argue, lies in derogation of the Origination Clause. Contrary to current practice, constitutional text, structure, history, and precedent, as well as normative considerations, mandate that tax treaties be implemented or approved through legislation passed by both houses of Congress.

Features of today's tax legislative and treaty environment have made the democratic concerns underlying the Clause even more acute—in sharp contrast to those concerns motivating the exclusion of the House from the Article II treaty process, which have fallen away in modern times. Involvement of the House would legitimize the tax treaty process through enhanced democratic representation, increased deliberation, and the reduction of special interest deals. These remedies would also breathe life into the process, the paucity of which has enabled tax treaties' circumvention of budgetary rules and has stymied discussion of purposes currently framed in century-old terms. Additionally the prescribed remedies allow the United States not only to honor its Constitution, but also to better uphold its obligations under international law by increasing the durability of its international commitments, creating more certainty for public and private actors. Finally, this analysis makes important contributions beyond
the context of tax treaties by shedding light on the vexing questions of whether and when the Constitution limits the reach of treaties and when, as a constitutional matter, treaties can or cannot be self-executing.

The Crime and Punishment of States

Gabriella Blum

Why is it that we no longer punish states, or, at least, do not admit to doing so? The moral rhetoric of “crime” and “punishment” of states has been excised from mainstream international law, and replaced with an amoral rhetoric of “threat” and “prevention.” Today, individuals alone are subject to international punishment, while states are subject only to preventive, regulatory, or enforcement measures.

Through a historical survey of the shift from punishment to prevention in various spheres of international law, I argue that the preference for prevention has been motivated by a strong preference for peace over justice as the ultimate goal of the international system. Driving this belief, I suggest, is an array of considerations, correlating punishment with humiliation and revenge, fearing the effects of collective punishment, doubting the operation of punishment in a decentralized structure built around the principle of sovereign equality, and bemoaning the absence of an international institution to adjudicate the criminality of states. However, given existing practices under the paradigm of “prevention,” none of these considerations seems to justify a correlation between peaceful coexistence and an aversion to punishment.

Further, the elimination of a punitive paradigm may implicate normative concerns, even accepting the preference for peace: in fact, a prevention-oriented framework may have its own distorted effects for international peace and security. Drawing on debates over preventive sanctions in U.S. domestic criminal law, I argue that even though prevention may sound like a less oppressive policy than punishment, it may in fact be far less constrained and more ruthless. At the same time, a preventive paradigm might be paralyzed from operating where there is a crime that does not immediately threaten other international actors. I demonstrate both possibilities using the contemporary debates over anticipatory self-defense and humanitarian intervention.

The Power To Detain: Detention of Terrorism

Oona Hathaway, Samuel Adelsberg, Spencer Amdur, Philip Levitz, Freya Pitts & Sirine Shebaya

Since the attacks of September 11, 2001, the United States has used the detention of suspected terrorists as a key element of its counterterrorism operations. Yet the sources of the U.S. government’s authority to detain suspected terrorists—and the limitations on that authority—remain ill defined. This Article fills that gap by clarifying the reach and limits of existing sources of U.S. government detention authority for counterterrorism purposes. It offers a comprehensive overview of the sources of government authority to detain terrorism suspects in law of war detention, including statutory and constitutional authority. It shows, moreover, that this authority is limited not only by its own terms but also by the law of armed conflict and human rights law. The Article then examines criminal law detention as an alternative to law of war detention for terrorism suspects. It argues that criminal law detention and prosecution of terrorism
suspects can produce better predictability, legitimacy, and flexibility than law of war detention and prosecution. In most cases, therefore, suspected terrorists can and should be charged and prosecuted within the federal criminal justice system. Doing so is not only more consistent with U.S. legal principles and commitments, but is also the most promising way forward in the fight against terrorism.

Note

When Does Internet Denial Trigger the Right of Armed Self-Defense?

This Note examines the international law of cyber-warfare. It identifies the conditions under which a distributed denial-of-service (DDoS) attack may qualify as an “armed attack” under various international legal instruments, including Article 51 of the U.N. Charter and Article 5 of the North Atlantic Treaty. By analogizing DDoS attacks to naval blockades, the Note offers new insights whose implications are set in stark relief against real-life events, particularly the 2007 DDoS attacks against Estonia. As critical infrastructure is more digitized than ever before, and as the distinction between hacks and attacks breaks down, the Note examines when, whether, and how a state may respond militarily in self-defense to a breach of cyber-security, grappling with an urgent, emerging question of international law.
Faculty Emeriti


Dennis S. Curtiss, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law


Faculty

Bruce Ackerman, B.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law and Political Science

Muneer I. Ahmad, A.B., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law

Anne Alston, B.A., J.D., Jaquinn D. Birenman Professor of Taxation

Ahil Reza Amu, B.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law

Ian Ayres, J.D., Ph.D., William K. Townsend Professor of Law

Jack M. Balkin, J.D., Ph.D., Knight Professor of Constitutional Law and the First Ammendment

Aharon Barak, LL.M., Dr.Jur., Visiting Professor of Law and Crouter Global Constitutional Fellow (fall term)

Megan A. Barnett, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Lea Brilmayer, J.D., Howard M. Hollerman Professor of International Law

Richard K. W. Brooks, J.D., Ph.D., Leighton Homer Subeck Professor of Law

Robert Amsterdam Burt, M.A., J.D., Alexander M. Ritchel Professor of Law (full term)


Stephen Lole Carter, B.A., J.D., William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law

Ann Chui, A.B., J.D., John M. Duff, Jr. Professor of Law

Dennis S. Curtiss, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Harlan Levy Dalton, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law

Megan Radovan Damakta, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Drew S. Days, III, B.A., LL.B., Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Toni Easterly Davis, J.D., Walter Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Carol L. Lucht, M.S.W., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Carol M. Rote, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tewenty Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Peter H. Schuck, J.D., LL.M., Simon E. Bickel Professor of Law and Professor (Adjunct) of Law

John G. Simon, L.L.B., L.L.M., Angustia E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinic Professor Emeritus of Law

Stephen Winter, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Yale Law School

Officers of Administration

Richard Charles Levin, B.A., B.Lit., Ph.D., President of the University

Peter Salovey, A.B., M.A., Ph.D., Provost of the University

Roben C. Post, J.D., Ph.D., Dean

Douglas Kysar, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean

S. Blair Kauffman, J.D., LLM., M.L.L., Law Librarian

Megan A. Barnett, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Toni Easterly Davis, J.D., LL.M., Associate Dean

Brent Dickman, B.B.A., M.B.A., Associate Dean

Mark LaFontaine, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Kathleen B. Overly, J.D., Ed.D., Associate Dean

Ada Ragaglia, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean

Mike K. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Faculty Emeriti


Dennis S. Curtiss, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Harlan Levy Dalton, B.A., J.D., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law

Megan Radovan Damakta, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Drew S. Days, III, B.A., LL.B., Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Toni Easterly Davis, J.D., Walter Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Carol L. Lucht, M.S.W., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Carol M. Rote, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tewenty Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Peter H. Schuck, J.D., LL.M., Simon E. Bickel Professor of Law and Professor (Adjunct) of Law

John G. Simon, L.L.B., L.L.M., Angustia E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinic Professor Emeritus of Law

Stephen Winter, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Faculty

Bruce Ackerman, B.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law and Political Science

Muneer I. Ahmad, A.B., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law

Anne Alston, B.A., J.D., Jaquinn D. Birenman Professor of Taxation

Ahil Reza Amu, B.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law

Ian Ayres, J.D., Ph.D., William K. Townsend Professor of Law

Jack M. Balkin, J.D., Ph.D., Knight Professor of Constitutional Law and the First Ammendment

Aharon Barak, LL.M., Dr.Jur., Visiting Professor of Law and Crouter Global Constitutional Fellow (fall term)

Megan A. Barnett, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Lea Brilmayer, J.D., Howard M. Hollerman Professor of International Law

Richard K. W. Brooks, J.D., Ph.D., Leighton Homer Subeck Professor of Law

Robert Amsterdam Burt, M.A., J.D., Alexander M. Ritchel Professor of Law (full term)


Stephen Lole Carter, B.A., J.D., William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law

Ann Chui, A.B., J.D., John M. Duff, Jr. Professor of Law

Dennis S. Curtiss, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Harlan Levy Dalton, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law

Megan Radovan Damakta, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Drew S. Days, III, B.A., LL.B., Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Toni Easterly Davis, J.D., Walter Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Carol L. Lucht, M.S.W., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Carol M. Rote, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tewenty Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Peter H. Schuck, J.D., LL.M., Simon E. Bickel Professor of Law and Professor (Adjunct) of Law

John G. Simon, L.L.B., L.L.M., Angustia E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinic Professor Emeritus of Law

Stephen Winter, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Yale Law School

Officers of Administration

Richard Charles Levin, B.A., B.Lit., Ph.D., President of the University

Peter Salovey, A.B., M.A., Ph.D., Provost of the University

Roben C. Post, J.D., Ph.D., Dean

Douglas Kysar, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean

S. Blair Kauffman, J.D., LLM., M.L.L., Law Librarian

Megan A. Barnett, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Toni Easterly Davis, J.D., LL.M., Associate Dean

Brent Dickman, B.B.A., M.B.A., Associate Dean

Mark LaFontaine, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Kathleen B. Overly, J.D., Ed.D., Associate Dean

Ada Ragaglia, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean

Mike K. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D., Associate Dean
Daniel Kevles, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)

Alves Keith Klevorick, M.A., Ph.D., John Thomas Smith Professor of Law and Professor of Economics (fall term)

Harold Hongju Koh, A.B., J.D., Martin R. Flug ’55 Professor of International Law (fall term)

Anthony Townsends Keenan, J.D., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law (fall term)

Douglass Kysar, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean and Joseph M. Field ’55 Professor of Law (fall term)

Mark LaFountain, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean (fall term)

John H. Langbein, LL.B., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law and Legal History (fall term)

Justin Lervit, Ph.D., M.P.A., Visiting Associate Professor of Law (spring term)

Yitzhak Linchak, Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law (fall term)

Carroll L. Locht, M.S.W., J.D., Clinical Emeritus Professor of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law (spring term)

Jennifer R. Maier, A.B., J.D., Sam Harris Professor of Corporate Law, Corporate Finance, and Securities Law (fall term)

Alva Miguel Poiries Pessas Madero, Lie. en Derecho (J.D.), Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)

Chibli Mallat, LL.M., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Oscar M. Rheeswesen Distinguished Senior Fellow (fall term)

Joseph G. Manning, A.M., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)

David Marcus, B.A., J.D., Maurice R. Greenberg Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)

Daniel Markovits, D.Phi., J.D., Guido Calabresi Professor of Law (spring term)

Jori Louis Mathew, LL.B., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law (fall term)

Braxton McKeel, M.D., Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)

Tracey L. Myers, B.S., J.D., Walton Hale Hamilton Professor of Law (fall term)

Noah Mertzing, B.A., J.D., Lecturer in the Practice of Law and Legal Writing (fall term)

Jeffrey A. Meyer, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)

Allie Miller, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Kathleen B. Overtly, J.D., Ed.D., Associate Dean (fall term)

Nicholas Parrillo, M.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law (fall term)

Jean Koh Peters, A.B., J.D., Sall Goldman Clinical Professor of Law and Supervising Attorney (fall term)

Thomas Pogge, Dipl. in Soziologie, Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct of Law (spring term)

Robert C. Portnoy, J.D., Ph.D., Dean and Sol & Lillian Goldman Professor of Law (fall term)

J. L. Post, J.A., Ph.D., Nahan Baker Clinical Professor of Law and Supervising Attorney (fall term)

Clare Priest, J.D., Professor of Law (fall term)

George L. Priest, B.A., J.D., Edward J. Phelps Professor of Law and Economics and Knaffman Distinguished Research Scholar in Law, Economics, and Entrepreneurship (fall term)

Asha Rangappa, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean (fall term)

William Michael Reisman, B.A., J.S.D., Myres S. McDougall Professor of International Law (fall term)

Judith Resnik, B.A., J.D., Arthur L. Miller Professor of Law (fall term)

Roberta Romano, M.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law (fall term)

Carol M. Rose, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Twenty Professor Emeritus of Law and Organizations and Professorial Lecturer in Law (fall term)

Susan Rose-Ackerman, B.A., Ph.D., Henry H. R. Luce Professor of Jurisprudence (Law School and Department of Political Science) (fall term)

Ted Rubenstein, A.B., J.D., Robert A. Slaughter Professor of Law (fall term)

Jennifer Thau Ruggi, M.Sc., Ph.D., Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

William M. Sage, M.D., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)

Peter H. Schuck, M.A., J.D., LL.M., Simeon E. Baldwin Professor Emeritus and Professor (adjunct of Law (fall term)

Vicki Schultz, B.A., J.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Law and Social Sciences (fall term)

Alan Schwartz, B.S., LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law (fall term)

Ian Shapiro, Ph.D., J.D., Professor (Adjunct of Law (spring term)

Scott J. Shapiro, J.D., Ph.D., Charles F. Southmayd Professor of Law and Professor of Philosophy (fall term)

Robert J. Shiller, S.M., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Reva Siegel, M.Phil., J.D., Nicholas dell. Kahnench Professor of Law (fall term)

Norman S. Silber, M.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)

James J. Silbey, M.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law (fall term)

John G. Simon, LL.B., J.D., Augustus E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law (fall term)

Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law (fall term)

Richard Squire, M.B.A., J.D., Florence Rogate Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)

Stephanie M. Stern, B.A., J.D., Irving S. Ribicoff Visiting Associate Professor of Law (fall term)

Richard B. Stewart, M.A., LL.B., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)

Rae Stith, M.P.P., J.D., Lafayette S. Foster Professor of Law (fall term)

Alex Stone Sweet, M.A., Ph.D., Littor Professor of International Law, Politics, and International Studies (fall term)

Mike T. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D., Associate Dean (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)

Tom T. Tyler, M.A., Ph.D., Macklin Fleming Professor of Law and Professor of Psychology (fall term)

Patrick Weil, M.B.A., Ph.D., Maurice R. Greenberg Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)

James Q. Whitman, J.D., Ph.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Comparative and Foreign Law (fall term)

Abraham L. Wickwire, J.D., Ed.D., Florence Rogate Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)

Lucian Wolfolb, LL.B., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Gruber Global Constitutionalism Fellow (fall term)

Ralph Kell Winter, Jr., M.A.H., LL.B., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)

Michael J. Witime, B.A., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor of Law (fall term)

John Fabian Win, Ph.D., Allen H. Dufty Class of 1960 Professor of Law (fall term)

Stephen Winer, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law (fall term)

Gideon Yaffe, A.B., Ph.D., Professor of Law and Professor of Philosophy (fall term)

Howard V. Zonana, B.A., M.D., Professor of Psychiatry and Clinical Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)

Lecturers in Law

Emily Baxten, B.A., J.D.

Cynthia Carr, J.D., LL.M.

Adam S. Cohen, A.B., J.D.

Linda Greenhouse, B.A., M.S.L., Joseph Goldstein Lecturer in Law

Adam Gregg, M.Phil., J.D.

Lucas Gutenbrunn, A.B., J.D.

Jamie P. Horley, M.A., J.D.

Margot E. Kaminsky, B.A., J.D.

Hope E. Menalf, B.A., J.D.

Christina M. Mulligan, B.A., J.D.

James E. Ponte, M.A., D.D.

Nina Rabin, B.A., J.D.

Sia M. Sainath, M.A., J.D.

Daniel Wade, M.S., J.D.

Visiting Lecturers in Law

Josh Abramowitz, A.B., J.D.

Guillermo Aguilar-Abrego, Lie. en Derecho (J.D.)

Richard Baxter, M.A., J.D., John R. Robison/Sullivan & Cromwell Visiting Lecturer in Accounting (fall term)

H.E. Stuart Beck, B.A., J.D.
Stephen B. Bright, B.A., J.D., Harvey Karp Visiting Lecturer in Law
Jennifer Gerrads Brown, A.B., J.D.
Brett Cohen, B.A., J.D.
Timothy C. Collins, B.A., M.B.A.
Victoria A. Cundiff, B.A., J.D.
Brian T. Daly, M.A., J.D.
Karl (Tom) Darmenbaum, M.A., J.D., Robina Foundation Visiting Human Rights Fellow
Eugene R. Fidell, B.A., LL.B., Florence Rogatz Visiting Lecturer in Law
Gregory Fleming, B.A., J.D.
Lawrence J. Fox, B.A., J.D., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law
Gregory Gansalves, B.S.
Benjamin W. Heineman, Jr., B.Litt, J.D.
Frank Jacobucci, LL.B., LL.M., Gruber Global Constitutionalism Fellow
Aaron Korman, M.Sc., J.D.
Barbara Marcus, M.S., Ph.D.
Charles Nathan, B.A., J.D.
Andrew J. Pincus, B.A., J.D.
Eric S. Robinson, M.B.A., J.D.
Charles A. Rothfeld, A.B., J.D.
David A. Schulz, M.A., J.D.
Michael S. Solender, B.A., J.D.
Laurence T. Sorkin, J.D., LL.M.
Sidney H. Stein, A.B., J.D.
David J. Stoll, B.A., J.D.
Christof R.A. Swaak, Ph.D.
William B. Taylor, B.A., LL.B.
Stefan R. Underhill, B.A., J.D.
John M. Walker, Jr., B.A., J.D.
David M. Zonow, B.A., J.D.

* On leave of absence, fall term, 2012-2013.
* On leave of absence, spring term, 2013.
THE YALE JOURNAL
OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 38, Number 1, Winter 2013

Editors-in-Chief
GISELLE BARCIA
TRAVIS PANIT

Executive Editors
JASMEET KAUR AHUJA
JANE S. JIANG

Executive Features Editors
HANNAH BRENNAN
KRISTIN ZAICHKIN

Managing Editors
LINDSEY V. COUNTS
SAMIR DEGER-SEN
AVERY WHITE

Articles Editors
I. DEBORAH FRANCOIS
ADAM GOLDENBERG
KATE HADLEY
CHRISTINA KONINGISOR
JOHN LEWIS
CHRISTOPHER NASON
WILL SMILEY
JACOB VICTOR

Features Editors
SHOUVIK BHATTACHARYA
AMANDA ELBOGEN
BENJAMIN F. FARKAS
CARLTON FORBES
ABIGAIL GRABER
ALISA SHEKHTMAN
JOSHUA SILVERSTEIN
CANEL TROUILLOT
EILEEN ZELEK

Development Editor
CANEL TROUILLOT

Submissions Editors
PIOTR BRZEZINSKI
GRACE KIM
SHENG LI
MINDY LU
SARAH MILLINGS
ALBERT NAH
FREYA PITTS
MICHAEL SHIH
ROMAIN ZAMOUR

Production Editor
STEPHEN DONNELLY

Senior Editors
KRISTA NELSON†
Tiffany Ng†
SALLY PEI
CLARE RYAN

Editors
LESLEY ESBRICK
NICOLE J. FEARAHIN
JURGEN GOOSSENS
BEN GRAHAM†
JORDAN C. HIRSCI
JULIE HUNTER
SUNG JIN
WILLIAM KALEMA†
LANAH KAMMOURIEH
JESSE KAPLAN
ALLANA KEMBABAGI†
JEREMY KESSLER
SAMUEL KLEINER
PHILIPP KOTLABA†
LUCAS LALLINGER
KATHRYN MAMMEL
DIEGO MATAMOROS
MATTHEW MELLEMA
CHRISTIAN MOTT
DAUD MUNIR

† Source Coordinator

EDWINA CLARKE
JANIS FOO
FARSHAD GHODOOSI

JAMES SHIH
JONATHAN N. SOLEIMANI
CAMERON A. VANSANT

FARSHAD GHODOOSI

JANIS FOO

LESLIE ESBRICK

N. ALEXANDER AIZENSTATD

Selin Akkan

N. ALEXANDER AIZENSTATD

JOSHUA ANDRESEN

ARIEL ANHOLT

JENNE AYERS

KRISTINE BECKERLE

MATTHEW BLUMENTHAL

MEGAN BROWDER

MARVIN BROWN

TRINITY BROWN

JOHN CALHOUN

YOO-N-ANGEL ANGELA CHOE

CHARLES DAMERON

ALLISON DAY

KYLE DELBAYCK

RACHEL DEMPSEY

ANNA DIKUN

AMANDA EL-DAKHALKHN

MONIKA EHRMAN

MATTHEW EISENSON

ROBERT NIGHTINGALE

GREGOR NOVAK

TEMIDAYO ODUSOLU

LILIAN TIMMERMANN

BRIANNA VAN KAN

JULIE VEROFF†

NICHOLAS WALLACE

JOHN C. WEI†

MENG JIA YANG

JONATHAN N. SOLEIMANI

CAMERON A. VANSANT

LESLIE ESBRICK

NICOLE J. FEARAHIN

JURGEN GOOSSENS

BEN GRAHAM†

JORDAN C. HIRSCI

JULIE HUNTER

SUNG JIN

WILLIAM KALEMA†

LANAH KAMMOURIEH

JESSE KAPLAN

ALLANA KEMBABAGI†

JEREMY KESSLER

SAMUEL KLEINER

PHILIPP KOTLABA†

LUCAS LALLINGER

KATHRYN MAMMEL

DIEGO MATAMOROS

MATTHEW MELLEMA

CHRISTIAN MOTT

DAUD MUNIR

ROBERT NIGHTINGALE

GREGOR NOVAK

TEMIDAYO ODUSOLU

LILIAN TIMMERMANN

BRIANNA VAN KAN

JULIE VEROFF†

NICHOLAS WALLACE

JOHN C. WEI†

MENG JIA YANG

† Source Coordinator