Harsh Justice for International Crimes?  
Margaret M. deGuzman

As the International Criminal Court (ICC) begins to sentence defendants for war crimes, crimes against humanity, and genocide, it must determine how much punishment is appropriate for these crimes. The initial sentencing decisions are especially important because they will serve as reference points for future sentences at the ICC and will likely influence the sentences of other international courts. Few international norms exist to guide the ICC. The punishment practices of other international courts have been inconsistent, ranging from very mild to quite severe. National norms are even more divergent. Punishments considered appropriate in some systems are deemed inhumane in others. Nonetheless, the limited commentary on the appropriate punishment severity for international crimes largely speaks with one voice: international justice should be harsh.

This Article takes issue with the call for harsh international punishment. Despite distracting appeals to punishment theory, such calls ultimately rest on the intuition that international crimes are so serious as to require harsh punishment. That intuition is misleading because at least in some cases, the rhetoric and narratives surrounding international crimes inflate perceptions of their seriousness. While judges exercising discretion cannot completely avoid the influence of intuitions, they should be cautious in applying them and should seek to develop norms to guide their sentencing decisions. Such norms should be rooted in the human rights regime in which international criminal courts are embedded. Attention to human rights norms will generally counsel leniency, and not harshness.

Comprehensive Immigration Reform(s):  
Stella Burch Elias

American lawmakers, jurists, and scholars are vigorously debating the future direction of immigration regulation in the United States. Following the passage on July 27, 2013 of Senate Bill 744, some kind of comprehensive reform seems increasingly likely. Immigration law is inherently interjurisdictional and transnational, but thus far the conversation about immigration reform has failed to look beyond our own national borders for alternative models or practices. This Article seeks to broaden the immigration regulation debate by contrasting recent developments in immigration
regulation in the United States with those in other countries with federal systems. In three federal nations that traditionally had widely divergent approaches to immigration regulation—Germany, Australia, and Canada—strikingly similar multitiered, multigovernmental systems of immigration regulation have emerged in recent years. This Article proposes that the future direction of immigration regulation in the United States should consider the German, Australian, and Canadian models of immigration law and policy to shed light on a range of potentially desirable legislative, regulatory, and policy options. The German, Australian, and Canadian experiences strongly suggest that any reform of our own immigration laws should permit states and localities to play a greater role in immigrant selection, a continued role in immigrant inclusion, and a more limited role in the enforcement of immigration laws that exclude immigrants from the country.

Charitable Giving, Tax Expenditures, and Direct Spending in the United States and the European Union

This Article compares the ways in which the United States and the European Union limit the ability of state-level entities to subsidize their own residents, whether through direct subsidies or through tax expenditures. It uses four recent charitable giving cases decided by the European Court of Justice (ECJ) to illustrate the ECJ's evolving tax expenditure jurisprudence and argues that, while this jurisprudence may suggest a new and promising model for fiscal federalism, it may also have negative social policy implications. It also points out that the court analyzes direct spending and tax expenditures under different rubrics despite their economic equivalence and does not provide a clear rule for distinguishing between the two, adding to the confusion of Member States and taxpayers. The Article then surveys the U.S. Supreme Court's Dormant Commerce Clause jurisprudence, under which the Court analyzes discriminatory state spending provisions. The Article concludes that although both the Supreme Court and the ECJ prioritize formalism over economic equivalence, the Supreme Court's approach to tax expenditures is more defensible than that of the ECJ due to the different federal structures of the two jurisdictions.
With increasing injections of foreign capital in the United States and rising national security concerns, the legislative and executive branches have played an expanded role in policing international investment in American companies. Arguably, no government group serves a more critical gatekeeping role than the Committee on Foreign Investment in the United States (CFIUS). Yet, its evaluative process, which permits it to examine and block any foreign attempt to garner control of an American entity, is completely obscured from the public purview. However, the Committee's secrecy does not preclude all studies of its review process. Using various government databases and reports, this Note produces one of the first empirical analyses of the CFIUS process. This Note shows through event studies that CFIUS actions lead to large protectionist wealth transfers, and the regression analysis indicates that despite claims of discriminatory application against certain nations, CFIUS denials are best explained by factors relating to valid concerns about national security.
Visiting Lecturers in Law

- Nicholas Townes, J.D., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law
- Dougall Kyrar, B.A., J.D., Joseph M. Field '35 Professor of Law
- Alexander L. Luther, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
- John H. Langhein, LL.B., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law and Legal History
- Andrew L. Lomax, J.D., Visiting Clinical Associate Professor of Law
- Yan Lin, Ph.D., J.D., Associate Professor of Law
- Carroll L. Law, M.S.W., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
- Jonathan R. Macey, A.B., J.D., Sam Harris Professor of Corporate Law, Corporate Finance, and Securities Law
- Daniella Markovits, Ph.D., J.D., Guide Celebrated Professor of Law
- Jerry Loomis Madison, LL.B., Ph.D., Sterling Professor of Law (fall term)
- Mary Breish Matheson, B.S., Associate Dean
- Tracey M. Metes, B.S., J.D., Wilson Hake Hamilton Professor of Law
- Noah Messing, B.A., J.D., Lecturer in the Practice of Law and Legal Writing
- Jeffrey A. Meyer, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law
- Jon D. Michaelis, M.A., J.D., Anne O'Connell Visiting Professor of Law
- Allen Miller, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
- John D. Morley, B.S., J.D., Associate Professor of Law
- Angela Morgan, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)
- Kadien B. Overby, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean
- Andrew Papachristos, M.A., J.D., Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)
- Nicholas R. Parrillo, M.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law
- Yosef K. Peters, B.A., J.D., Seltzer Goldstein Clinical Professor of Law and Supervising Attorney
- Thomas Pogge, Dipl. in Sociology, Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
- Robert C. Port, J.D., Ph.D., Dean and Sol & Lilian Goldman Professor of Law
- J. L. Pottinger, Jr., A.B., J.D., Nathan Baker Clinical Professor of Law and Supervising Attorney
- Clare Point, J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law
- George L. Pfen, B.A., J.D., Edward J. Phelps Professor of Law and Economics and Kaufman Distinguished Research Scholar in Law, Economics, and Environmental Policy
- Asha Ranagappa, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean
- William Michael Reisman, B.A., J.D., Myers McDougall Professor of International Law
- Judith Rends, B.A., J.D., Arthur Loman Professor of Law
- Deborah L. Rhode, B.A., J.D., Florence Roger Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
- Cristina Rodriguez, M.Litt., J.D., Professor of Law
- Roberta Romano, M.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law
- Carol M. Rose, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization, and Professorial Lecturer in Law (fall term)
- Susan Rose-Ackerman, B.A., Ph.D., Henry R. Luce Professor of Jurisprudence (Law School and Department of Political Science)
- Jed Rubenfeld, A.B., J.D., Robert E. Slaughter Professor of Law
- S. S. Saks, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Grover Global Constitutionalism Fellow (full term)
- David Schacter, M.Sc., J.D., Prose S. Ruben Visiting Associate Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)
- Peter H. Schuck, M.A., J.D., LLM., Stephen E. Balsami Visiting Professor Emeritus and Professor (Adjunct) of Law (full term)
- Vicki Schulte, B.A., J.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Law and Social Sciences
- Alan Schwartz, M.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law
- Ian Shapiro, J.D., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)
- Scott J. Shapiro, J.D., Ph.D., Charles F. Southwick Professor of Law and Professor of Philosophy
- Rave Singel, M.Phil., J.D., Nicholas B.B. Keenebach Professor of Law
- James T. Silva, M.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
- John G. Simon, LL.B., L.L.D., Augusta E. Lincee Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
- Robert D. Sloane, Dipl., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)
- Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law
- Karen Stuh, M.P.F. J.D., Lifford S. Foster Professor of Law
- Alix Steve Sweet, M.A., Ph.D., Leiter Professor of International Law, Politics, and International Studies
- Mike E. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D., Associate Dean
- Tom T. Tyler, B.A., Ph.D., Macklin Fleming Professor of Law and Professor of Psychology
- Patricia Well, M.B.A., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Oscar M. Rutherford Distinguished Fellow in Law (fall term)
- James O. Whitman, J.D., Ph.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Comparative and Foreign Law
- Robert K. Wint, B.A., L.L.B., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
- Michael J. Wrixon, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean for Experiential Education, William O. Douglas Clinical Professor of Law, and Director, J.D./J.M. Program in Law and Legal Services Organization
- John Fabric Wint, J.D., Ph.D., Allen Ags, Class of 133 Professor of Law
- Stephen Winton, B.A., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
- Glendon Yeaf, A.B., Ph.D., Professor of Law and Professor of Philosophy
- Noah D. Zatz, M.A., J.D., Florence Roger Visiting Professor of Law
- Howard V. Zinn, B.A., J.D., Professor of Psychiatry and Clinical Professor (Adjunct) of Law
- Peter Zumoffen, LL.M., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)

Lecturers in Law

- Emily Baxton, B.A., J.D.
- Gregg Ginsberg, B.S.
- Linda Greenhouse, B.A., M.S.L., Joseph Goldstein Lecturer in Law
- Lucas Gutierrez, A.B., J.D.
- Su Lin Han, M.A., J.D.
- Jamie P. Horsley, J.D.
- Morgan E. Kaminski, B.A., J.D.
- Hope R. Metalis, B.A., J.D.
- James E. Moster, M.A., J.D.
- Yael Stull, B.A., J.D.
- Robert D. Williams, B.A., J.D.

Visiting Lecturers in Law

- Guillermo Aguilar-Alvarez, Lic. en Derecho (J.D.)
- Yas Banifarsi, Ph.D., LL.M.
- Richard Hart, M.A., J.D., John B. Ruben/Sullivan & Cromwell Visiting Lecturer in Accounting
- Stephen B. Bright, B.A., J.D., Harvey Karp Visiting Lecturer in Law
- Lincoln Caplan, A.B., J.D.
- Susan L. Carney, B.A., J.D.
- Robert N. Chisholm, A.B., J.D.
- Timothy C. Collins, B.A., M.B.A.
- Victoria A. Candis, B.A., J.D.
- Brian T. Dalrymple, B.A., J.D.
- Karl (Tom) DeMeo, B.A., M.A., J.D.
- Eugene R. Fiddell, B.A., LL.B., Florence Roger Visiting Lecturer in Law
- Gregory Fleming, B.A., J.D.
- Lawrence J. Fox, B.A., J.D., George W. and Shaula D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law
- Stephen Fradin, A.B., LL.B.
- Peter T. Gross, Jr., M.A., J.D.
- Benjamin W. Hezman, Jr., B.Litt., J.D.
- Frank Incicchetti, LL.B., LL.M., Grover Global Constitutionalism Fellow
- Andrew J. Finnie, B.A., J.D.
- Megan Quattlebaum, B.A., J.D.
- Eric S. Robinson, M.B.A., J.D.
- Charles A. Robidou, A.B., J.D.
- Sarah Rusell, B.A., J.D.
John M. Samuels, J.D., LL.M.
Paul Schwaiger, M.A., Ph.D.
Michael S. Solender, B.A., J.D.
Sidney H. Stein, A.B., J.D.
Stefan R. Underhill, B.A., J.D.
John M. Walker, Jr., B.A., J.D.
Ashbel T. Wall II, B.A., J.D.

† On leave of absence, fall term, 2013-2014.
‡ On leave of absence, spring term, 2014.
THE YALE JOURNAL
OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 39, Number 1, Winter 2014

ADVISORY BOARD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Institute or Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ROBERT B. AHDEIH</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Emory Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OONA A. HATHAWAY</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NICHOLAS ROSTOW</td>
<td>Professor, National Defense</td>
<td>University, Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEA BRILMAYER</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MELANIE KHANNA</td>
<td>Senior Donor Relations Officer</td>
<td>United Nations Human Rights Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEPHEN RUCKMAN</td>
<td>Special Appointee</td>
<td>Executive Division, Maryland Attorney General's Office, Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMY CHUA</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MITCHEL LASER</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Cornell University Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAMES J. SILK</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIRJAN DAMASKA</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JANET KOVEN LEVIT</td>
<td>Dean</td>
<td>University of Tulsa College of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALEC STONE SWEET</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAURA DICKINSON</td>
<td>Professor, Sandra Day O'Connor</td>
<td>College of Law, Arizona State University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greta S. Milligan</td>
<td>Associate</td>
<td>Covington &amp; Burling LLP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PATRICIA WALD</td>
<td>Judge, D.C. Circuit</td>
<td>Court of Appeals (Retired)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OWEN M. FISS</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROBERT C. POST</td>
<td>Dean</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOHN D. WATSON, JR.</td>
<td>Partner</td>
<td>Latham &amp; Watkins LLP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAUL GEWIRTZ</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W. MICHAEL REISMAN</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAMES Q. WHITMAN</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUSAN ROSE-ACKERMAN</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Yale Law School</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The editors would like to acknowledge, with gratitude, the generous support for the *Yale Journal of International Law* in its thirty-ninth year from:

CHARLES L. FELSENTHAL
CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP
DEBEVOISE & PLIMPTON LLP
THE FELSENTHAL DONATION IN MEMORY OF HARRY D. FELSENTHAL
FRESHFIELDS BRUCKHAUS DERINGER LLP
W. MICHAEL REISMAN
NICHOLAS ROSTOW
THE ROSTOW DONATION IN MEMORY OF EUGENE V. ROSTOW
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP

The editors would also like to recognize the thoughtful contributions of:

OONA A. HATHAWAY
HAROLD HONGJU KOH
ROBERT C. POST
KEVIN ROSE
SUSAN ROSE-ACKERMAN
SCOTT SHAPIRO
MIKE K. THOMPSON
THE YJIL ADVISORY BOARD