Abstracts

Articles

Harsh Justice for International Crimes?  
Margaret M. deGuzman  1

As the International Criminal Court (ICC) begins to sentence defendants for war crimes, crimes against humanity, and genocide, it must determine how much punishment is appropriate for these crimes. The initial sentencing decisions are especially important because they will serve as reference points for future sentences at the ICC and will likely influence the sentences of other international courts. Few international norms exist to guide the ICC. The punishment practices of other international courts have been inconsistent, ranging from very mild to quite severe. National norms are even more divergent. Punishments considered appropriate in some systems are deemed inhumane in others. Nonetheless, the limited commentary on the appropriate punishment severity for international crimes largely speaks with one voice: international justice should be harsh.

This Article takes issue with the call for harsh international punishment. Despite distracting appeals to punishment theory, such calls ultimately rest on the intuition that international crimes are so serious as to require harsh punishment. That intuition is misleading because at least in some cases, the rhetoric and narratives surrounding international crimes inflate perceptions of their seriousness. While judges exercising discretion cannot completely avoid the influence of intuitions, they should be cautious in applying them and should seek to develop norms to guide their sentencing decisions. Such norms should be rooted in the human rights regime in which international criminal courts are embedded. Attention to human rights norms will generally counsel leniency, and not harshness.

Comprehensive Immigration Reform(s):  
Stella Burch Elias  37

Immigration Regulation Beyond Our Borders

American lawmakers, jurists, and scholars are vigorously debating the future direction of immigration regulation in the United States. Following the passage on July 27, 2013 of Senate Bill 744, some kind of comprehensive reform seems increasingly likely. Immigration law is inherently interjurisdictional and transnational, but thus far the conversation about immigration reform has failed to look beyond our own national borders for alternative models or practices. This Article seeks to broaden the immigration regulation debate by contrasting recent developments in immigration
regulation in the United States with those in other countries with federal systems. In three federal nations that traditionally had widely divergent approaches to immigration regulation—Germany, Australia, and Canada—strikingly similar multitiered, multigovernmental systems of immigration regulation have emerged in recent years. This Article proposes that the future direction of immigration regulation in the United States should consider the German, Australian, and Canadian models of immigration law and policy to shed light on a range of potentially desirable legislative, regulatory, and policy options. The German, Australian, and Canadian experiences strongly suggest that any reform of our own immigration laws should permit states and localities to play a greater role in immigrant selection, a continued role in immigrant inclusion, and a more limited role in the enforcement of immigration laws that exclude immigrants from the country.

Charitable Giving, Tax Expenditures, and Direct Spending in the United States and the European Union

This Article compares the ways in which the United States and the European Union limit the ability of state-level entities to subsidize their own residents, whether through direct subsidies or through tax expenditures. It uses four recent charitable giving cases decided by the European Court of Justice (ECJ) to illustrate the ECJ's evolving tax expenditure jurisprudence and argues that, while this jurisprudence may suggest a new and promising model for fiscal federalism, it may also have negative social policy implications. It also points out that the court analyzes direct spending and tax expenditures under different rubrics despite their economic equivalence and does not provide a clear rule for distinguishing between the two, adding to the confusion of Member States and taxpayers. The Article then surveys the U.S. Supreme Court's Dormant Commerce Clause jurisprudence, under which the Court analyzes discriminatory state spending provisions. The Article concludes that although both the Supreme Court and the ECJ prioritize formalism over economic equivalence, the Supreme Court's approach to tax expenditures is more defensible than that of the ECJ due to the different federal structures of the two jurisdictions.
With increasing injections of foreign capital in the United States and rising national security concerns, the legislative and executive branches have played an expanded role in policing international investment in American companies. Arguably, no government group serves a more critical gatekeeping role than the Committee on Foreign Investment in the United States (CFIUS). Yet, its evaluative process, which permits it to examine and block any foreign attempt to garner control of an American entity, is completely obscured from the public purview. However, the Committee's secrecy does not preclude all studies of its review process. Using various government databases and reports, this Note produces one of the first empirical analyses of the CFIUS process. This Note shows through event studies that CFIUS actions lead to large protectionist wealth transfers, and the regression analysis indicates that despite claims of discriminatory application against certain nations, CFIUS denials are best explained by factors relating to valid concerns about national security.
Yale Law School

Officers of Administration
Peter Salovey, A.B., M.A., Ph.D, President of the University
Benjamin Polak, B.A., M.A., Ph.D, Provost of the University
Robert C. Post, J.D., Ph.D, Dean
Alvin Keith Klevorick, M.A., Ph.D, Deputy Dean
Michael J.征编, B.A., J.D, Deputy Dean for Experiential Education
S. Blair Kauffman, J.D., LL.M., M.L.L, Law Librarian
Meglio R. Barrett, B.A., J.D, Associate Dean
Joseph M. Crosby, B.A., M.B.A, Associate Dean
Toni Hahn Davis, J.D., LL.M, Associate Dean
Mary Bruce Matheson, B.S, Associate Dean
Kathleen B. Overy, J.D., E.D, Associate Dean
Asa Rangappa, A.B., J.D, Associate Dean
Mike K. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D, Associate Dean

Faculty Emeriti
Dezus E. Curris, B.S, LL.B, Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harbes Leigh Balon, B.A., J.D, Professor Emeritus of Law
Stephen Radnity Danakal, L.L.B, Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Drew S. Dayz III, B.A., LL.B, Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Lisa Gitter Demuth, LL.B, Ph.D, Walter Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Owen M. Fiss, M.B.A, LL.B, Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert W. Gordon, A.B., J.D, Chancellor Kent Professor Emeritus of Law and Legal History
Michael J. Grof, B.A., LL.B, J.D,., Juana S. Horkins Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Geoffrey Cornell Haued, J.D, M.A, LL.B, Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law
Quinn Johnston, B.A., J.S.D, Juana S. Horkins Professor Emeritus of Law
Carolee L. Lucht, M.S.W, J.D, clinical professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Carol M. Rose, J.D., Ph.D, Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Peter H. Schuck, M.A., J.D, E.D, Stephen B. Bickel Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
John G. Simon, LL.B, LL.D, Augustus E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D, Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law
Stephen Winer, A.B., J.D, William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Faculty
Bruce Ackerman, B.A., LL.B, Sterling Professor of Law and Political Science
Muneer I. Ahmad, A.B, J.D, Clinical Professor of Law
Anelle L. Altinit, B.A., J.D, Jacob D. Schiffman Professor in Taxation
Ahil Redd Attar, B.A., J.D, Sterling Professor of Law
Ivan Ayers, J.D, Ph.D, William K. Townsend Professor of Law
Jack M. Balkin, J.D, Ph.D, Knight Professor of Constitutional Law and the First Amendment
Athan Bank, LL.M, J.D, Visiting Professor of Law and Global Constitutionalism Fellow (fall term)
Megan A. Barnett, B.A, J.D, Associate Dean
Seyla Benhabib, B.A, Ph.D, Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
Lea Brilmayer, J.D, LL.M, Howard M. Holtmann Professor of International Law
Richard R.W, Brooks, B.A, J.D, Professor Emeritus of Law
Robert Amsterdam Hurt, B.A., M.A, J.D, Alexander M. Bickel Professor of Law (full term)
Steven G. Calabresi, B.A., J.D, Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Stephanie Lue Carter, B.A., J.D, William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law
Amy Chua, A.B, J.D, John D. Muf, Jr. Professor of Law
Kristin A. Collins, M.A, J.D, Sidney Austin-Robert D. Muen '70 Visiting Professor of Law
Korean M. Cory, B.A, M.B.A, Associate Professor of Law
Dennis E. Curtis, B.S, LL.B, Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harbes Leigh Balon, B.A., J.D, Professor Emeritus of Law
Stephen Radnity Danakal, L.L.B, Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Stephen Danvall, B.A, Ph.D, Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
Toni Hahn Davis, J.D, LL.M, Associate Dean
Drew S. Dayz III, B.A., LL.B, Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Giacomo della Canna, Ph.D, Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Jan Gitter Demuth, LL.B, Ph.D, Walton Flade Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Aron Dizh, B.L, LL.M, Canadian Bicentenial Visiting Professor of Law
Pia M. Doheby, B.A, J.D, Clinical Associate Professor of Law
Steven Baris Duker, J.D, LL.M, Professor of Law
Robert C. Effelchick, A.B, LL.B, Walter E. Meyer Professor of Property and Urban Law (spring term)
Edwin Donald Elson, B.A, J.D, Professor (Adjunct) of Law
William N. Evrige, J.D, M.A, J.D, John A. Garver Professor of Jurisprudence
Dudley C. Esty, M.A, J.D, Hillhouse Professor of Environmental Law and Policy, School of Forestry & Environmental Studies; and Clinical Professor of Environmental Law and Policy, Law School
Owen M. Fox, M.A, LL.LB, Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
James Forman, Jr., A.B, J.D, Clinical Professor of Law
Emmanuel Galllitch, Ph.D, Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)
Leah Garlicki, Doctorate in Legal Sciences, Nahit in Legal Sciences, Visiting Professor of Law and Patricia Gruber Fellow in Global Justice (spring term)
Heather K. Gerken, B.A, J.D, Skelly Wright Professor of Law
Paul Gewirtz, B.A, J.D, Foster Stewart Professor of Constitutional Law
Abbe R. Gluck, B.A, J.D, Associate Professor of Law
Robert W. Gordon, A.B, J.D, Chancellor Kent Professor Emeritus of Law and Legal History
Michael J. Grof, B.A, LL.B, J.D, Juana S. Horkins Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law (fall term)
David Singh Greveal, J.D, Ph.D, Associate Professor of Law
Doron Gitman, LL.M, Dr.Jur., Visiting Professor of Law and Peter and Patricia Gruber Fellow in Global Justice (spring term)
Henry B. Hautmann, J.D, Ph.D, Oscar M. Buebhauser Professor of Law
Robert D. Harrison, J.D, Ph.D, Lecturer in Legal Method
Oona Hathaway, B.A, J.D, Gerard C. and Bernice Larove Smith Professor of International Law
Quinn Johnston, LL.M, J.S.D, Juana S. Horkins Professor Emeritus of Law
Christine Jolls, J.D, Ph.D, Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor of Law and Organization
Dae M. Kahal, B.A, J.D, Elizabeth K. Dollard Professor of Law and Psychology
Paul W. Kahn, J.D, Ph.D, Robert W. Winner Professor of Law and the Humanities
Amy Kaczmarski, M.A, J.D, Associate Professor of Law
S. Blair Kauffman, J.D, LL.M, M.L.L, Law Librarian and Professor of Law
Gregory S. Kirshe, B.A, Ph.D, Florence Rognes Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Daniel Klevorick, B.A, Ph.D, Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
Alvin Keith Klevorick, M.A, Ph.D, Deputy Dean, John Thomas Smith Professor of Law, and Professor of Economics
Jonathan Klick, Ph.D, J.D, Maurice R. Greenberg Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Harold Norga Kohn, A.B, J.D, Sterling Professor of International Law
John M. Samuels, J.D., LL.M.
Paul Schwaber, M.A., Ph.D.
Michael S. Solender, B.A., J.D.
Sidney H. Stein, A.B., J.D.
Stefan R. Underhill, B.A., J.D.
John M. Walker, Jr., B.A., J.D.
Ashbel T. Wall II, B.A., J.D.

† On leave of absence, fall term, 2013-2014.
‡ On leave of absence, spring term, 2014.
THE YALE JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 39, Number 1, Winter 2014

ADVISORY BOARD

ROBERT B. AHDIEH
Professor, Emory Law School

OONA A. HATHAWAY
Professor, Yale Law School

NICOLAS ROSTOW
Professor, National Defense University, Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 7

LEA BRILMAYER
Professor, Yale Law School

MELANIE KHANNA
Senior Donor Relations Officer, United Nations Human Rights Council

STEPHEN RUCKMAN
Special Appointee, Executive Division Maryland Attorney General’s Office, Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 32

AMY CHUA
Professor, Yale Law School

MITCHEL LASSEr
Professor, Cornell University Law School

JAMES J. SILK
Professor, Yale Law School

MIRJAN DAMASKA
Professor, Yale Law School

JANET KOVEN LEVIT
Dean, University of Tulsa College of Law

ALEC STONE SWEET
Professor, Yale Law School

LAURA DICKINSON
Professor, Sandra Day O’Connor College of Law, Arizona State University

GRETA S. MILLIGAN
Associate, Covington & Burling LLP

PATRICIA WALD
Judge, D.C. Circuit Court of Appeals (Retired)

OWEN M. FISS
Professor, Yale Law School

ROBERT C. POST
Dean, Yale Law School

JOHN D. WATSON, JR.
Partner, Latham & Watkins LLP

PETER GEWIRTZ
Professor, Yale Law School

W. MICHAEL REISMAN
Professor, Yale Law School

JAMES Q. WHITMAN
Professor, Yale Law School

SUSAN ROSE-ACKERMAN
Professor, Yale Law School
The editors would like to acknowledge, with gratitude, the generous support for the *Yale Journal of International Law* in its thirty-ninth year from:

CHARLES L. FELSENTHAL  
CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP  
DEBEVOISE & PLIMPTON LLP  
THE FELSENTHAL DONATION IN MEMORY OF HARRY D. FELSENTHAL  
FRESHFIELDS BRUCKHAUS DERINGER LLP  
W. MICHAEL REISMAN  
NICHOLAS ROSTOW  
THE ROSTOW DONATION IN MEMORY OF EUGENE V. ROSTOW  
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP

The editors would also like to recognize the thoughtful contributions of:

OONA A. HATHAWAY  
HAROLD HONGJU KOH  
ROBERT C. POST  
KEVIN ROSE  
SUSAN ROSE-ACKERMAN  
SCOTT SHAPIRO  
MIKE K. THOMPSON  
THE YJIL ADVISORY BOARD