THE YALE JOURNAL
OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 40, Number 1, Winter 2015

Contents

Articles
Reforming the State from Afar: Structural Reform Litigation at the Human Rights Courts
Alexandra Huneeus 1

“Reasonable Doubt” in Islamic Law
Intisar A. Rabb 41

Rethinking the Temporary Breach Puzzle: A Window on the Future of International Trade Conflicts
Mark Wu 95

Note
Is Successful Water Privatization a Pipe Dream?: An Analysis of Three Global Case Studies
Tanya Kapoor 157

Recent Developments

Recent Publications

193

203
The editors would like to acknowledge, with gratitude, the generous support for the *Yale Journal of International Law* in its fortieth year from:

**CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP**
**DEBEVOISE & PLIMPTON LLP**
**CHARLES L. FELSENTHAL**
**THE FELSENTHAL DONATION IN MEMORY OF HARRY D. FELSENTHAL**
**FRESHFIELDS BRUCKHAUS DERINGER LLP**
**W. MICHAEL REISMAN**
**NICHOLAS ROSTOW**
**THE ROSTOW DONATION IN MEMORY OF EUGENE V. ROSTOW**
**SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP**

The editors would also like to recognize the thoughtful contributions of:

**HAROLD HONGJU KOH**
**ROBERT C. POST**
**W. MICHAEL REISMAN**
**KEVIN ROSE**
**SUSAN ROSE-ACKERMAN**
**SCOTT SHAPIRO**
**MIKE K. THOMPSON**
**THE YJIL ADVISORY BOARD**
Abstracts

Articles

Reforming the State from Afar: Structural Reform Litigation at the Human Rights Courts

Alexandra Huneeus

The most recent twist in the story of structural reform litigation is international. To their traditional role of declaring violations and ordering remedies for victims, the European and the Inter-American Courts of Human Rights have added a more ambitious project: the implementation of structural changes at the national level. And, like the U.S. Supreme Court in the school desegregation and prison reform cases, they have begun to encounter their own institutional and political limits. This Article is the first to view the courts’ recent forays into structural reform litigation through a comparative lens. Using Abram Chayes’ classic study of public law litigation in the United States as a springboard, it reveals the reasons for the emergence of structural reform litigation at the transnational level, and the unique strategies the courts use to maintain legitimacy despite stretching their mandates.

“Reasonable Doubt” in Islamic Law

Intisar A. Rabb

Against a popular notion of Islamic law as a limited set of texts of divine origin that bar judicial discretion and require harsh punishment, this Article argues that Muslim jurists historically generated a doctrine of “reasonable doubt” in response to changing social and political contexts. In a move astonishing for its boldness and its virtual invisibility, those jurists transformed the doubt doctrine from reports of early judicial practices into a foundational legal text. That is, jurists writing at the end of the long founding period of Islamic law (seventh to eleventh centuries) successfully claimed that the Prophet Muhammad himself had announced a “doubt canon” in the seventh century—directing judges to avoid criminal punishments in cases of doubt. The transformation was so complete and the claim so effective that few later jurists were aware of the dubious prophetic pedigree for the Islamic doctrine of doubt. Remarkably, medieval Muslim jurists deployed concepts of doubt to assert interpretive power over Islamic law, to define institutional relationships, and either to curb executive overreach in or to assert parameters for legitimate punishment. In effect, they used ever-expanding definitions of doubt to construct the very elements and institutions of legitimate crime and punishment that they sought to regulate.
This surprising turn of events is like a modern-day U.S. constitutional amendment that passes without going through any legislation or ratification process, and where history forgets that the textual modification was not a part of the original document. The forgotten history of doubt in Islamic law is crucial to understanding the most pressing questions surrounding the reemergence of Islamic law as state law in modern constitutional and criminal contexts. As an originalist legal tradition, Islamic law today heavily relies on the past for definitions of Islamic constitutional and criminal law, often in ways that are unaware of the prominent role of discretion and doubt in Islam's founding period and beyond. This Article explores the history of doubt.

Rethinking the Temporary Breach Puzzle: A Window on the Future of International Trade Conflicts

The World Trade Organization (WTO) is held out as an exemplar of an effectively functioning international "court." Yet, a puzzle remains unexplained: in WTO litigation, a respondent found to have enacted an illegal trade policy measure needs only to remedy the illegality. So long as it does, the WTO lacks the authority to order retrospective remedies to be paid to the complainant for past harm. The remedies loophole provides countries with a "free pass" for temporary breach. Why do more countries not take advantage of this pass more frequently? How is it that the WTO manages to function effectively in spite of its imperfect remedies?

This Article suggests that the key to understanding the answer to this puzzle lies in the importance of power asymmetries in a WTO system that is dynamic and evolving. It identifies a series of policy instruments available to a powerful country whenever its trading partner is tempted to undertake a temporary breach that harms the powerful state's interests. These instruments create additional costs that offset the benefit of any temporary breach, thereby effectively deterring most, albeit not all, temporary breaches. In addition, the established powers share a collective interest in maintaining the WTO system's stability. This also causes them to exercise collective self-restraint in their own exercise of temporary breaches.

The answer to this puzzle is of more than just academic importance. It also sheds important light on the future of the international trade regime. As geopolitical power shifts and trade among developing countries increases, particular countries may find it more tempting to engage in temporary breaches under certain circumstances. This Article examines the nature of these emergent conflicts and discusses its implications for the future of the global trading regime.
For decades, governments across the world have struggled to privatize their water systems. In the developing world, water privatizations have often led to bitter populist clashes, public health crises, and cancelled concession agreements. This Note studies three water privatizations and analyzes why certain privatizations fail and others succeed. By analyzing privatizations through three factors—class dynamics, deal structure, and political climate—this Note suggests ways in which developing governments can structure water privatizations to deliver long-term improvements to local communities. This Note argues that successful water privatizations often dilute class dynamics by instituting progressive pricing schemes, promote business transparency by requiring stringent due diligence, and advance citizens' interests by employing strict regulatory oversight. By replicating these features, developing governments are more likely to negotiate successful water privatization deals on behalf of their citizens.
YALE LAW SCHOOL

Officers of Administration
Peter Salovey, A.B., A.M., Ph.D., President of the University
Benjamin Polak, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Provost of the University
Robert C. Post, J.D., Ph.D., Dean
Alvin K. Kleinerick, M.A., Ph.D., Deputy Dean
Michael J. Wishnie, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean for Experiential Education
S. Blair Kaufman, J.D., LL.M., M.L.L., Law Librarian
Megan A. Barnett, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean
Joseph M. Crosby, B.A., M.B.A., Associate Dean
Toni Hahn Davis, J.D., LL.M., Associate Dean
Mary Briese Matheron, B.S., Associate Dean
Kathleen B. Overly, J.D., Ed.D., Associate Dean
Asha Rangappa, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean
Mike K. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Faculty Emeriti
Guido Calabresi, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Dennis E. Curtis, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harlon L. Dalton, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Mirjan R. Damalka, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Drew S. Days, III, B.A., LL.B., Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Jan Ginter Deutsch, LL.B., Ph.D., Walton Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Owen M. Fiss, M.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert W. Gordon, A.B., J.D., Chancellor Kent Professor Emeritus of Law and Legal History
Michael J. Graetz, B.B.A., LL.B., LL.D., Justus S. Hotchkiss Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Carroll L. Lucht, M.S.W., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Carol M. Rose, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Peter H. Schuck, M.A., J.D., LL.M., Simeon E. Baldwin Professor Emeritus and Professor (Adjunct) of Law
John Q. Simon, LL.B., LL.D., Augustus Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law
Stephen Wizner, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Faculty
Bruce Ackerman, B.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law and Political Science
Muneer I. Ahmad, A.B., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
Anne L. Alstott, B.A., J.D., Jacob D. Bierman Professor in Taxation
Akhil Reed Amar, B.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law
Ian Ayres, J.D., Ph.D., William K. Townsend Professor of Law
Jack M. Balkin, J.D., Ph.D., Knight Professor of Constitutional Law and the First Amendment
Aharon Barak, LL.M., Dr.Jur., Visiting Professor of Law and Gruber Global Constitutionalism Fellow (fall term)
Seyla Benhabib, Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)
Eyal Benvenisti, J.S.D., LL.M., LL.B., Visiting Professor of Law and Patricia Gruber Fellow in Global Justice (spring term)
Philip C. Bobbitt, A.B., Ph.D., Florence Rognes Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Lea Brilmayer, J.D., LL.M., Howard M. Holtzmann Professor of International Law
Richard W. Brooks, Ph.D., J.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law
Robert A. Burt, M.A., J.D., Alexander M. Bickel Professor of Law (fall term)
Steven G. Calabresi, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Stephen L. Carter, B.A., J.D., William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law
Amy Chua, A.B., J.D., John M. Duff, Jr. Professor of Law
Dennis E. Curtis, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harlon L. Dalton, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Mirjan R. Damalka, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Drew S. Days, III, B.A., LL.B., Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Jan Ginter Deutsch, LL.B., Ph.D., Walton Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Aaron Dhir, LL.B., LL.M., Canadian Bicentennial Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Fiona Doherty, B.A., J.D., Clinical Associate Professor of Law
Steven B. Duke, J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law
Zev J. Eigen, B.S., J.D., Ph.D., Irving S. Ribicoff Visiting Associate Professor of Law (spring term)
Robert C. Ellickson, A.B., LL.B., Walter E. Meyer Professor of Property and Urban Law
E. Donald Elliott, B.A., J.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law
James I. Silk, M.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
John G. Simon, LL.B., LL.D., Augustus E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law
Kate Stith, M.P.P., J.D., Lafayette S. Foster Professor of Law
Alex Stone Sweet, M.A., Ph.D., Leiter Professor of International Law, Politics, and International Studies
Heather E. Tookes, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)
Gerald Torres, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)

Tom R. Tyler, M.A., Ph.D., Macklin Fleming Professor of Law and Professor of Psychology
Neil Walker, LL.B., Ph.D., LL.D., Sidney Austin-Robert D. McLean Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Patrick Well, M.B.A., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Oscar M. Ruebhausen Distinguished Fellow in Law (fall term)

James Q. Whitman, J.D., Ph.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Comparative and Foreign Law
Ralph K. Winter, Jr., M.A.H., LL.B., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)
Michael J. Wishnie, B.A., J.D., Deaugt Dean for Experiential Education, William O. Douglas Clinical Professor of Law, and Director, Jerome N. Frank Legal Services Organization
John Fabian Witt, J.D., Ph.D., Allen H. Duffy Class of 1960 Professor of Law
Stephen Wizner, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Gideon Yaffe, A.B., Ph.D., Professor of Law, Professor of Philosophy, and Professor of Psychology
Howard V. Zonana, B.A., M.D., Professor of Psychiatry and Clinical Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Lecturers in Law
Emily Bazelon, B.A., J.D.
James Dawson, B.A., J.D.
Gregg Gonsalves, B.S.
Linda Greenhouse, B.A., M.S.L., Joseph Goldstein Lecturer in Law
John Allen Grim, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.
Lucas Gutten tag, A.B., J.D.
Mary Evelyn Tucker, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.

Visiting Lecturers in Law
Guillermo Aguilar-Alvarez, Lic. en Derecho (J.D.)
Yas Banifatemi, Ph.D., LL.M.
Mark Barnes, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
Richard Baxter, M.A., J.D., John R. Raben/Sullivan & Cromwell Visiting Lecturer in Accounting
Stephen B. Bright, B.A., J.D., Harvey Karp Visiting Lecturer in Law
Lincoln Caplan, A.B., J.D., Truman Capote Visiting Lecturer in Law
Robert N. Chatigny, A.B., J.D.
Wayne Dale Collins, B.S., M.S., J.D.
Victoria A. Cundiff, B.A., J.D.
Melanie L. Fein, B.A., J.D.
Eugene R. Fidell, B.A., LL.B., Florence Rogatz Visiting Lecturer in Law
Gregory Fleming, B.A., J.D.
Lawrence J. Fox, B.A., J.D., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law
Stephen Freudin, A.B., LL.B.
Peter T. Grossi, Jr., M.A., J.D.
Katherine M. Kimpel, B.A., J.D.
Jeffrey A. Meyer, B.A., J.D.
Charles M. Nathan, B.A., J.D.
Eric S. Robinson, M.B.A., J.D.
Sarah French Russell, B.A., J.D.
John M. Samuels, J.D., LL.M., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law
Michael S. Solender, B.A., J.D.
David J. Stoll, B.A., J.D.
Jake Sullivan, B.A., M.Phil, J.D., Oscar M. Ruebhausen Distinguished Visiting Lecturer in National Security
Stefan R. Underhill, B.A., J.D.
John M. Walker, Jr., B.A., J.D., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law
David M. Zornow, B.A., J.D.

‡ On leave of absence, spring term, 2015.
THE YALE JOURNAL
OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 40, Number 1, Winter 2015

Advisory Board

ROBERT B. AHDIEH
Professor,
Emory Law School

OOONA A. HATHAWAY
Professor,
Yale Law School

NICHOLAS ROSTOW
Professor,
National Defense University,
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 7

LEA BRILMAYER
Professor,
Yale Law School

MELANIE KHANNA
Senior Donor Relations
Officer,
United Nations Human
Rights Council

STEPHEN RUCKMAN
Special Appointee, Executive
Division, Maryland
Attorney General’s Office,
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 32

AMY CHUA
Professor,
Yale Law School

MITCHEL LASSEER
Professor,
Cornell University Law
School

JAMES J. SILK
Professor,
Yale Law School

MIRJAN DAMAŠKA
Professor,
Yale Law School

JANET KOVEN LEVIT
Dean,
University of Tulsa College of
Law

ALEC STONE SWEET
Professor,
Yale Law School

LAURA DICKINSON
Professor,
The George Washington
University Law School

GRETA S. MILLIGAN
Assistant General Counsel
to the US Trade
Representative
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 33

PATRICIA WALD
Judge, D.C. Circuit
Court of Appeals (Retired)

OWEN M. FISS
Professor,
Yale Law School

ROBERT C. POST
Dean,
Yale Law School

JOHN D. WATSON, JR.
Partner,
Latham & Watkins LLP
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 9

PAUL GEWIRZ
Professor,
Yale Law School

W. MICHAEL REISMAN
Professor,
Yale Law School

JAMES Q. WHITMAN
Professor,
Yale Law School

SUSAN ROSE-ACKERMAN
Professor,
Yale Law School
THE YALE JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 40, Number 1, Winter 2015

Editors-in-Chief
ALLISON DAY
LESLEI ESBROOK

Executive Editors – Articles
ROBERT NIGHTINGALE
JOHN C. WEI

Executive Editors - Features
WILLIAM KALEMA
ALLANA KEMBABAZI

Managing Editors
JOHN C. CALHOUN
PHILIPP KOTLABA
TEMIDAYO ODUSOLU

Articles Editors
MEGAN BRAUN
LINDSAY BREWER
AKUNNA COOK
STEVEN LEVY
VIVAAN NEHRU
BEN V. PICOZZI
PETER TZENG
ANDREW WALCHUK

Features Editors
YUTIAN AN
DANIEL HESSER
GRACE HEUSNER
BERT MA
HAVA MIRELL
TASNIM MOTALA
BRITTA REDWOOD
NOAH SIMMONS

Submissions Editors
JORDAN BRYANT
IDRISSE FOFANA
JAYOUNG JEON
TANYA KAPOOR
MAEGHAN MIKORSKI
ALBERT PAK
PHILIP POOLE
JOSEPH SAEI

Production Editor
NOAH SIMMONS

Senior Editors
MEGAN BROWDER
MARTHA FERSON

Editors
JAAP BAAIJ
DENISHA BACCHUS
AHSAN BARKATULLAH†
JORDAN BLASHEK†
RYAN BURNINGHAM
MANUEL CASAS MARTINEZ
ELIZABETH CHAN
MICHAEL CHUNG
SEAN COLENZO-SEMPLE
MICHAEL COTTER
JOHN EHRETT
TAL EISENZWEIG†
RAFFAEL NICOLAS FASEL
RHEA FERNANDES
TRISTANA GIUNTA
JOHANNA GOehler
JOSHUA HANDLESMAN
JOHN JO

PAUL JOO†
CLAIRE KIM
ARTHUR LAU
ADRIENNE LEE†
ELIZABETH LEISERSON
AARON LEVINE
ALINA LINDBLOM
RAYMOND LU
NICHOLAS MAKAROV
ELIZABETH MARSH
YURU MELNYK
MARIAN MESSING
ELITZA MIHAYLOVA
ANNA MOHAN
KATHERINE MUNYAN
JEESOO NAM
MY KHANH NGO†
JENNA PAVELEC

† Source Coordinator

Managing Editors
JOHN C. CALHOUN
PHILIPP KOTLABA
TEMIDAYO ODUSOLU

Submissions Editors
JORDAN BRYANT
IDRISSE FOFANA
JAYOUNG JEON
TANYA KAPOOR
MAEGHAN MIKORSKI
ALBERT PAK
PHILIP POOLE
JOSEPH SAEI

Production Editor
NOAH SIMMONS

Senior Editors
MEGAN BROWDER
MARTHA FERSON

Editors
JAAP BAAIJ
DENISHA BACCHUS
AHSAN BARKATULLAH†
JORDAN BLASHEK†
RYAN BURNINGHAM
MANUEL CASAS MARTINEZ
ELIZABETH CHAN
MICHAEL CHUNG
SEAN COLENZO-SEMPLE
MICHAEL COTTER
JOHN EHRETT
TAL EISENZWEIG†
RAFFAEL NICOLAS FASEL
RHEA FERNANDES
TRISTANA GIUNTA
JOHANNA GOehler
JOSHUA HANDLESMAN
JOHN JO

PAUL JOO†
CLAIRE KIM
ARTHUR LAU
ADRIENNE LEE†
ELIZABETH LEISERSON
AARON LEVINE
ALINA LINDBLOM
RAYMOND LU
NICHOLAS MAKAROV
ELIZABETH MARSH
YURU MELNYK
MARIAN MESSING
ELITZA MIHAYLOVA
ANNA MOHAN
KATHERINE MUNYAN
JEESOO NAM
MY KHANH NGO†
JENNA PAVELEC

† Source Coordinator