Contents

Articles

The Indian Way of Humanitarian Intervention

A Contractual Approach to Investor-State Regulatory Disputes

The Combatant's Privilege in Asymmetric and Covert Conflicts

Note

Hidden in Plain Sight: The Federal Reserve's Role in U.S. Foreign Policy

Recent Developments

Recent Publications
Abstracts

Articles

The Indian Way of Humanitarian Intervention

Gary J. Bass 227

This Article seeks to restore India’s 1971 war for Bangladesh to ongoing debates about the legality of humanitarian intervention, using recently declassified documents from Indian and U.S. archives. This momentous case reveals India’s approach to international law, showing how the world’s largest democracy and a major Asian postcolonial power engaged with legal norms of intervention, widening the discussion of intervention beyond Western states.

Although some political theorists have viewed India’s 1971 war against Pakistan as a justifiable humanitarian intervention, international legal authorities at the time chastised India for violating Pakistan’s sovereignty and threatening the international order. Rather than a Nehruvian insistence on non-intervention, India’s legal approach showed considerable convergence with the arguments used by Western liberal democracies in the 1990s. India, with a complex mix of strategic and altruistic motives, justified its intervention with a series of interlocking claims: (i) an argument from human rights, (ii) an argument from genocide, (iii) an argument from self-determination, and (iv) an argument from Indian sovereignty.

While India sought multilateral support, it was widely condemned at the United Nations for an illegal unilateral intervention, with no prospect of a Chapter VII resolution to legitimize its policies. This outcome was partially due to weaknesses in India’s legal case, but more the result of Cold War hostility toward India from both the United States and China. Looking forward from 1971, the Bangladesh war might be considered as part of a controversial but evolving pattern of state practice of humanitarian intervention.

A Contractual Approach to Investor-State Regulatory Disputes

Richard C. Chen 295

International investment arbitral tribunals are increasingly tasked with resolving regulatory disputes. This relatively new form of dispute involves a challenge by a foreign investor to a host state’s generally applicable regulation, enacted in good faith to promote the public interest but resulting incidentally in harm to the investor’s business. Such claims typically invoke the “fair and equitable treatment” standard provided for in the bilateral investment treaty between the host state and the investor’s home state. The dominant view among
commentators, and increasingly among the tribunals themselves, is that regulatory disputes should be analyzed within a public law framework, using tools derived from constitutional or administrative law. That means, for example, balancing the investor's rights and host state's regulatory concerns as part of a proportionality analysis. I argue that the public law approach is flawed because it requires tribunals to weigh incommensurable values and ultimately to make policy judgments when they lack the expertise and legitimacy to do so.

This Article proposes that tribunals instead draw on tools from contract law and theory to approximate what the contracting states intended when they agreed to a fair and equitable treatment standard. The investment treaties themselves give no guidance on how that standard should be applied to regulatory disputes. When courts confront similar gaps in contracts, they do not simply abandon the inquiry into the parties' intent but instead apply additional tools or principles to form the best possible estimate. The Article explores three specific tools: a default rule approach and two default standards derived from contract law's analysis of changed circumstances. More generally, I argue that a contractual approach, by focusing tribunals on the contracting states' intent rather than requiring them to independently assess the substance of a host state's policy, will facilitate more principled reasoning as well as enhance the tribunals' legitimacy, and thereby better promote the goals of international investment in the long run.

The Combatant's Privilege in Asymmetric and Covert Conflicts

In armed conflicts against extraterritorial non-state actors, covert action has quickly moved from the exception to the rule. U.S. military and paramilitary forces are engaged in global drone and infantry deployments that remain officially unacknowledged by the government. However, the literature has lagged behind in not questioning how basic principles of the law of war—whose architecture depends on the link between individual combatants and the political entities they fight for—apply in covert action, which obscures and denies this link. This Article provides a deeper analysis of covert action by concentrating on the basic building block of the law of war: the privilege of combatancy—the right of lawful belligerents to kill in wartime free from criminal liability. In order to analyze this question, this Article first interrogates a deeper orthodoxy of the field: that the privilege of combatancy never applies in non-international armed conflicts. Drawing on historical and conceptual analysis, this Article concludes that the orthodox view is both simplistic and exaggerated; the more subtle answer is that government forces and rebels can qualify for the privilege in some situations, though governments retain the right to prosecute vanquished rebels for treason (but not murder). Applying this insight to asymmetric conflicts against terrorist networks, the privilege attaches to any side that meets the classical requirements for lawful belligerency: wearing a fixed emblem, carrying arms openly, maintaining a responsible command, and respecting basic customs of warfare—a standard that terrorists inevitably fail. However, government forces also fail the standard when they participate in covert action, regardless of whether the force is exercised by Central Intelligence Agency operatives or uniformed soldiers of the
Armed Forces. Individual soldiers become legitimate combatants only when they carry their arms openly and their state asserts the privilege on their behalf—a logical impossibility when the state refuses to acknowledge the use of force in the first place.

Note

Hidden in Plain Sight: The Federal Reserve’s Role in U.S. Foreign Policy

Katherine Clark Harris

This Note considers the Federal Reserve Board’s (FRB) role in foreign policy using a newly released data set: 1,865 pages of Federal Open Market Committee meeting transcripts from 2008. These transcripts provide a window into the important decisions made by the FRB during the recent financial crisis. This Note argues that these decisions had substantial bearing on U.S. foreign policy: (i) extending $850 billion of international swap lines to certain nations and not others and (ii) jointly coordinating global interest rate cuts with six foreign central banks. As global markets grow more interconnected and the use of sanctions and other economic levers increase, the FRB’s role in U.S. foreign policy will only become more salient. Consequently, the FRB should voluntarily issue guidelines to clarify when and how it will engage with the political branches on international matters. Voluntary guidelines strike the appropriate balance between institutionalizing coordination norms and protecting central bank independence. To date, legal scholars have only explored the FRB from an administrative law perspective. This Note moves beyond this domestic-centric focus and situates the FRB among principals and agents in U.S. foreign policy, raising new questions about central bank independence beyond the water’s edge.
YALE LAW SCHOOL

Officers of Administration
Peter Salovey, A.B., A.M., Ph.D., President of the University
Benjamin Polak, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Provost of the University
Robert C. Post, J.D., Ph.D., Dean
Alvin K. Klevorick, M.A., Ph.D., Deputy Dean
Michael J. Wishnie, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean for Experiential Education
S. Blair Kauffman, J.D., LL.M., M.L.L., Law Librarian
Megan A. Barnett, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean
Joseph M. Crosby, B.A., M.B.A., Associate Dean
Toni Hahn Davis, J.D., LL.M., Associate Dean
Mary Briese Matheron, B.S., Associate Dean
Kathleen B. Overly, J.D., Ed.D., Associate Dean
Asha Rangappa, A.B., J.D., Associate Dean
Mike K. Thompson, M.B.A., J.D., Associate Dean

Faculty Emeriti
Guido Calabresi, LL.B., Dr.Jur., LL.D., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Dennis E. Curtis, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harlon L. Dalton, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Mirjan R. Damatka, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Drew S. Days, III, B.A., LL.B., Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Jan Ginter Deutsch, LL.B., Ph.D., Walton Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Owen M. Fiss, M.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert W. Gordon, A.B., J.D., Chancellor Kent Professor Emeritus of Law and Legal History
Michael J. Graetz, B.B.A., LL.B., Justus S. Hotchkiss Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Carroll L. Lucht, M.S.W., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Carol M. Rose, J.D., Ph.D., Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization, and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Peter H. Schuck, M.A., J.D., LL.M., Simeon E. Baldwin Professor Emeritus and Professor (Adjunct) of Law
John G. Simon, B.A., LL.B., Augustus E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law
Stephen Wizner, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Faculty
Bruce Ackerman, B.A., LL.B., Sterling Professor of Law and Political Science
Muneer I. Ahmad, A.B., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
Anne L. Alstott, B.A., J.D., Jaccqueline D. Bierman Professor in Taxation
Akhil Reed Amar, B.A., J.D., Sterling Professor of Law
Ian Ayres, J.D., Ph.D., William K. Townsend Professor of Law
Jack M. Balkin, J.D., Ph.D., Knight Professor of Constitutional Law and the First Amendment
Aharon Barak, LL.M., Dr.Jur., Visiting Professor of Law and Graber Global Constitutionalism Fellow (fall term)
Seyla Benhabib, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)
Eyal Benvenisti, J.S.D., LL.M., LL.B., Visiting Professor of Law and Peter and Patricia Gruber Fellow in Global Justice (spring term)
Philip C. Bobbitt, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Florence Rogatz Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Lea Brilmayer, J.D., LL.M., Howard M. Holtzmann Professor of International Law
Richard R. W. Brooks, Ph.D., J.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law
Robert A. Burt, M.A., J.D., Alexander M. Bickel Professor of Law (fall term)
Seyla Benhabib, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)
Eyal Benvenisti, J.S.D., LL.M., LL.B., Visiting Professor of Law and Peter and Patricia Gruber Fellow in Global Justice (spring term)
Philip C. Bobbitt, A.B., J.D., Florence Rogatz Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Lea Brilmayer, J.D., Howard M. Holtzmann Professor of International Law
Richard R. W. Brooks, Ph.D., J.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law
Robert A. Burt, M.A., J.D., Alexander M. Bickel Professor of Law (fall term)
Steven G. Calabresi, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Stephan L. Carter, B.A., B.D., William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law
Amy Chua, A.B., J.D., John M. Duff, Jr. Professor of Law
Dennis E. Curtis, B.S., LL.B., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Harlon L. Dalton, B.A., J.D., Professor Emeritus of Law
Mirjan R. Damatka, LL.B., Dr.Jur., Sterling Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Drew S. Days, III, B.A., LL.B., Alfred M. Rankin Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Jan Ginter Deutsch, LL.B., Ph.D., Walton Hale Hamilton Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law
Aaron Dhur, LL.B., LL.M., Canadian Bicentennial Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)
Fiona Doherty, B.A., J.D., Clinical Associate Professor of Law
Steven B. Duke, J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law
Robert J. Shiller, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)

Reva Siegel, M.PHIL., J.D., Nicholas deB. Katzenbach Professor of Law

Norman I. Silber, Ph.D., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)

James J. Silk, M.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law

John G. Simon, LL.B., LL.D., Augustine E. Lines Professor Emeritus of Law and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Robert A. Solomon, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law

Kate Stith, M.P.P., J.D., Lafayette S. Foster Professor of Law

Alex Stone Sweet, M.A., Ph.D., Leitner Professor of International Law, Politics, and International Studies

Heather E. Tookes, B.A., Ph.D., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (fall term)

Gerald Torres, J.D., LL.M., Visiting Professor of Law (spring term)

Tom R. Tyler, M.A., Ph.D., Macklin Fleming Professor of Law and Professor of Psychology

Neil Walker, LL.B., Ph.D., LL.D., Sidney Austin-Robert D. McLean Visiting Professor of Law (fall term)

Patrick Weil, M.B.A., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law and Oscar M. Ruebhausen Distinguished Fellow in Law (fall term)

James Q. Whitman, J.D., Ph.D., Ford Foundation Professor of Comparative and Foreign Law

Ralph K. Winter, Jr., M.A.H., LL.B., Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Michael J. Wishnie, B.A., J.D., Deputy Dean for Experiential Education, William O. Douglas Clinical Professor of Law, and Director, Jerome N. Frank Legal Services Organization

John Fabian Witt, J.D., Ph.D., Allen H. Duffl Class of 1969 Professor of Law

Stephen Wizner, A.B., J.D., William O. Douglas Clinical Professor Emeritus of Law, Supervising Attorney, and Professorial Lecturer in Law

Gideon Yaffe, A.B., Ph.D., Professor of Law, Professor of Philosophy, and Professor of Psychology

Howard V. Zonana, B.A., M.D., Professor of Psychiatry and Clinical Professor (Adjunct) of Law (spring term)

Lecturers in Law

Emily Bazelon, B.A., J.D.

James Dawson, B.A., J.D.

Gregg Gonsalves, B.S.

Linda Greenhouse, B.A., M.S.L., Joseph Goldstein Lecturer in Law

John Allen Grim, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.

Lucas Guttenag, A.B., J.D.

Mary Evelyn Tucker, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.

Visiting Lecturers in Law

Guillermo Aguilar-Alvarez, Lic. en Derecho (J.D.)

Yas Banifatemi, Ph.D., LL.M.

Mark Barnes, B.A., J.D., LL.M.

Richard Baxter, M.A., J.D., John R. Raben/Sullivan & Cromwell Visiting Lecturer in Accounting

Stephen Bright, B.A., J.D., Harvey Karp Visiting Lecturer in Law

Lincoln Caplan, A.B., J.D., Truman Capote Visiting Lecturer in Law

Robert N. Chatigny, A.B., J.D.

Wayne Dale Collins, B.S., M.S., J.D.

Victoria A. Cundiff, B.A., J.D.

Melanie L. Fein, B.A., J.D.

Eugene R. Fidell, B.A., LL.B., Florence Rogatz Visiting Lecturer in Law

Gregory Fleming, B.A., J.D.

Lawrence J. Fox, B.A., J.D., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law

Stephen Fraidin, A.B., LL.B.

Peter T. Grossi, Jr., M.A., J.D.

Katherine M. Kimpel, B.A., J.D.

Jeffrey A. Meyer, B.A., J.D.

Charles M. Nathan, B.A., J.D.

Eric S. Robinson, M.B.A., J.D.

Sarah French Russell, B.A., J.D.

John M. Samuels, J.D., LL.M., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law

Michael S. Solender, B.A., J.D.

David J. Stoll, B.A., J.D.

Jake Sullivan, B.A., M.PHIL., J.D., Oscar M. Ruebhausen Distinguished Visiting Lecturer in National Security

Stefan R. Underhill, B.A., J.D.

John M. Walker, Jr., B.A., J.D., George W. and Sadella D. Crawford Visiting Lecturer in Law

David M. Zornow, B.A., J.D.


‡ On leave of absence, spring term, 2015.
Advisory Board

ROBERT B. AHIDIEH
Professor,
Emory Law School

OONA A. HATHAWAY
Professor,
Yale Law School

NICHOLAS ROSTOW
Professor,
National Defense University,
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 7

LEA BRILMAYER
Professor,
Yale Law School

MELANIE KHANNA
Senior Donor Relations
Officer,
United Nations Human
Rights Council

STEPHEN RUCKMAN
Associate,
BuckleySander LLP,
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 32

AMY CHUA
Professor,
Yale Law School

MITCHEL LASSER
Professor,
Cornell University Law
School

JAMES J. SILK
Professor,
Yale Law School

MIRJAN DAMAKA
Professor,
Yale Law School

JANET KOVEN LEVIT
Dean,
University of Tulsa College of
Law

ALEC STONE SWEET
Professor,
Yale Law School

LAURA DICKINSON
Professor,
The George Washington
University Law School

GRETA MILLIGAN PEISCH
International Trade Counsel,
Senate Finance Committee,
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 33

PATRICIA WALD
Judge,
D.C. Circuit Court of Appeals
(Retired)

OWEN M. FISS
Professor,
Yale Law School

ROBERT C. POST
Dean,
Yale Law School

JOHN D. WATSON, JR.
Partner,
Latham & Watkins LLP,
Editor-in-Chief, Vol. 9

PAUL GEWIRTZ
Professor,
Yale Law School

W. MICHAEL REISMAN
Professor,
Yale Law School

JAMES Q. WHITMAN
Professor,
Yale Law School

SUSAN ROSE-ACKERMAN
Professor,
Yale Law School
THE YALE JOURNAL
OF INTERNATIONAL LAW
Volume 40, Number 2, Summer 2015

Editors-in-Chief
ALLISON DAY
LESLIE ESBROOK

Executive Editors – Articles
ROBERT NIGHTINGALE
JOHN C. WEI

Executive Editors – Features
WILLIAM KALEMA
ALLANA KEMBABAZI

Features Editors
YUTIAN AN
 DANIEL HESSEL
GRACE HEUSNER
 BERT MA
HAVA MIRELLE
TASNIM MOTALA
BRITTA REDWOOD

Managing Editors
JOHN C. CALHOUN
PHILIPP KOTLABA
TEMIDAYO ODUSOLU

Submissions Editors
JORDAN BRYANT
 IDRISS FOANA
JAYOUNG JEON
TANYA KAPOOR
MAEGHAN MIKORSKI
ALBERT PAK
PHILIP POOLE
JOSEPH SAEI

Production Editor
NOAH SIMMONS

Senior Editors
YOUSIF ABUGHARBIEH
Selin Akkan
Moeun Cha

Martha Ferson
Demetre Klebaner

Editors
CORNELIS BAAIJ
DENISHA BACCHUS
AIHSAN BARKATULLAH†
ERIN BALDWIN
ELIZABETH CHAN
MICHAEL CHUNG
SEAN COLENZO-SEMPLE
JOHN EHRETT†
TAL EISENZWEIG†
ANDREAS ENGEL
RAFAEL NICOLAS FASEL
JOSHUA HANDELSMAN
MARK HANIN

JOHN JO
PAUL JOOT
CLAIRE KIM
ARTHUR LAU
ADRIENNE LEE
HYUNGWOO LEE
ELIZABETH LEISERSON
ALINA LINDBLOM†
RAYMOND LU
ASAF LUBIN
ELIZABETH MARSH
MARIAN MESSING
RORY MINNIS
ANNA MOHAN

HANNAH MOTLEY
LEO O’TOOLE
PETER POSADA†
ALEXANDER RESAR
MARISSA ROY†
MATTHEW SPECHT
MITZI STEINER
PAUL STRAUCH
AMNART TANGKIRIPHIMARN
JACQUELINE VAN DE VELDE†
HEATHER WONG
YOULIN YUAN
TARA ZIVKOVIC

† Source Coordinator