Book Review: The Real Soviet Russia

Edwin Borchard

Yale Law School

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/fss_papers

Part of the Law Commons

Recommended Citation

https://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/fss_papers/3622

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Yale Law School Faculty Scholarship at Yale Law School Legal Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Scholarship Series by an authorized administrator of Yale Law School Legal Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact julian.aiken@yale.edu.
True, Mannheim should not be criticized for his lack of interest in medieval France. But it should be noticed that Mannheim, in a book about the compatibility of modern Science and Christianity, seems so utterly unaware of the fact that such compatibility has begun to be sensed by representative writers and even, where it might have been least expected, in the dusty stacks of philologists.

And yet, it seems that some such awakening to an outlook on History and Progress other than a naively rectilinear one is imperative for the sincere revitalization of our Faith, the Faith that would make us experience Our Time in a manner more scientific, but not less mysterious, than in the days of the Apostles.

ALFRED ADLER†


AMERICANS have a duty henceforth to acquaint themselves not only with the social system of Russia, a great ally, but with a social system competing with their own. For that reason, the present book should be obligatory reading. The author, a Menshevik Russian located in this country, and a distinguished scholar, has obtained access to Russian publications which for the most part are closed books to American citizens. The work makes authentic and fascinating reading because it rests to a large extent on statistics which are embroidered by great historical and social insight. Without sign of hostility or denunciation, it exposes the weakness of the Russian social system as few books have done. If any American believes that the United States has much that is beneficial to learn from the system of Soviet Russia—the so-called "dictatorship of the proletariat"—he has but to read The Real Soviet Russia to be enlightened. Russian citizens who were accustomed to Czarist rule might submit to the new form of regimentation. Those who profit by it might even like it. But how any American citizen can endorse the loss of every vestige of freedom and submit to the hardships and dangers of the individual under the Soviet regime is a little beyond comprehension.

The author demonstrates his superiority as an historian and sociologist by his analysis of the limits of Stalin's realism, and by his understanding of Trotsky's expansionist aims. Short chapters on the religious and foreign policy show a tolerant understanding of a doctrinaire conception. But the author's major contributions lie in his analysis of the new social structure: the bureaucracy, the new "Upper Classes," already amounting, with families, to 28 million people who must be supported; the working class, for whose alleged benefit the whole revolution was begun; the peasantry, who have changed masters but remain in abject poverty; the large group dedi-

† Professor of Modern Languages, Northland College.
cated to "forced labor," who seem to be treated below the human level; the Communist Party, a small group of tried and true doctrinaires, and their supporting henchmen in the self-serving Komsomol; the Red Army; and the NKVD, the secret police, numbering in excess of two million.

It is regrettable that the Soviet experiment was not permitted to proceed without obstacle. The Bolshevik government, even though of startlingly novel type, should have received recognition in 1920. The promiscuous confiscation of private property was of course shocking to the western world, but its illegalities or the resulting protest seem to have become tempered with the passage of time and with that sudden need for Soviet Russia as an ally which has led to the pouring of billions into the Soviet maw by the erstwhile victims of confiscation. It is probable that the author suspects that the magnificent performances of the Red Army are rendered in the name of Russia rather than of Communism, for Communism is but a remote hope for the future when the "state" shall have withered away. The sole present reality is state socialism. It appears clear, however, that the tight little group in the Politbureau have abandoned none of their aims and are likely to drive through to the bitter end.

That Soviet Russia is riding for an eventual fall Dr. Dallin does not doubt. Its economic miscalculations, apart from its incidental social evils, he exposes and necessarily condemns. He expects the disintegration to become evident at the end of the present war, though, politically speaking, Soviet Russia will by that time have completed the metamorphosis from the most despised to the strongest nation in Europe and Asia. What this will mean for the western world only time can tell.

EDWIN BORCHARD†


This is a thorough and a comprehensive book, and its title does not belie its content. It represents an editorial achievement of signal merit: thousands of cases, statutes, treaties and administrative rulings, often inconsistent and usually unavailable, have been collected in an organic treatment for the first time. Its twenty-three chapter headings include Federal Indian Legislation, The Scope of Tribal Self-Government, Personal Rights and Liberties of Indians, Tribal Property, and Indian Treaties—to mention only a few. A wealth of technical detail never interferes with readability; expertise is given substance by "a belief that the protection of minority rights and the substitution of reason and agreement for force and dictation represent a contribution to civilization, a belief that confusion and ignorance in fields of law are allies of despotism, . . . a belief that under-

† Justus S. Hotchkiss Professor of Law, Yale Law School.